



**CITY OF SAN ANTONIO
OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION**

**COMPLIANCE AND TECHNICAL ADVISORY BOARD
MEETING MINUTES
FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 23, 2024**

The City of San Antonio Compliance and Technical Advisory Board (“CTAB”) met on February 23, 2024, at 1901 South Alamo Street, San Antonio, Texas 78204.

MEETING CALLED TO ORDER:

Chairwoman Sepulveda called the meeting to order at 8:46 a.m.

ROLL CALL:

PRESENT: Flores, Setser, Fullerton, Smith (virtual), Vasquez, and Sepulveda.

ABSENT: Burgard

ANNOUNCEMENTS:

- Spanish interpreter services available to the public during the hearing.
- Item 3 was pulled by the applicant from the consent agenda for individual consideration.

CHAIRMAN’S STATEMENT:

Chairwoman Sepulveda provided a statement regarding meeting processes, appeals, time limits, decorum.

APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

MOTION: Commissioner Flores moved to approve CTAB meeting minutes for January 19, 2024. Commissioner Setser seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Flores, Setser, Fullerton, Smith, Vasquez, and Sepulveda.

NAY: None.

ABSENT: Burgard

ACTION: MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES. 0 NAYS. 1 ABSENT.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

- Item 2 – Bianca Maldonado, on behalf of the Monticello Park Neighborhood Association, submitted a voicemail concurring with staff’s recommendations.

Chairwoman Sepulveda asked if any commissioner would like to pull items from the Consent Agenda. No Commissioners requested an item be pulled for individual consideration.

CONSENT AGENDA:

Item 1, Case No. 2024-067	334 W MULBERRY AVE
Item 2, Case No. 2024-068	250 QUENTIN DR
Item 4, Case No. 2024-052	639 MISSION ST

MOTION: Commissioner Vasquez moved to approve items 1, 2, and 4 with staff stipulations. Commissioner Flores seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Flores, Setser, Fullerton, Smith, Vasquez, and Sepulveda.
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Burgard

ACTION: MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES. 0 NAYS. 1 ABSENT.

INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION ITEMS:

ITEM 3. HDRC NO. 2024-042
ADDRESS: 120 E MULBERRY AVE
APPLICANT: Ashley Gray/GRAY BRADLEY G & ASHLEY R

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to remove all the existing wood windows and wholesale replace them with aluminum-clad wood windows.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff does not recommend approval of the replacement of wood windows based on findings b through e. Staff recommends the applicant repair the wood windows with in-kind materials.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

MOTION: Commissioner Vasquez moved to approve with staff recommendations.
Commissioner Flores seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Flores, Setser, Smith, Vasquez, and Sepulveda.
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Burgard
ABSTAIN: Fullerton

ACTION: MOTION PASSED with 5 AYES. 0 NAYS. 1 ABSENT. 1 ABSTAIN.

ITEM 5. HDRC NO. 2024-032
ADDRESS: 103 FIR
APPLICANT: Otoniel Trevino/STATT PROPERTIES INC

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to convert an original window opening to a door opening on the front façade.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff does not recommend approval based on findings c and d. Staff recommends that the original window be reinstalled and that the opening should return to its original size and profile.

Should the Compliance and Technical Advisory Board find the proposed conversion to be appropriate, staff recommends an architecturally appropriate wood door be installed. The door should be submitted to OHP staff prior to purchase and installation.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

MOTION: Commissioner Vasquez moved to approve with staff recommendations.
Commissioner Fullerton seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Flores, Setser, Fullerton, Smith, Vasquez, and Sepulveda.
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Burgard

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES. 0 NAYS. 1 ABSENT.**

ITEM 6. HDRC NO. 2024-065
ADDRESS: 507 FURR DR
APPLICANT: Juan Martinez/transformations paint and remo

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Replace the existing, clay barrel tile roof with a standing seam metal roof.
2. Remove the existing flower boxes located beneath the second-floor windows on the front façade.

RECOMMENDATION:

1. Staff does not recommend approval of item #1, roof replacement, as proposed. Staff recommends a clay barrel tile roof be installed, or a composite material, that matches the original in profile, material and texture.
2. Staff does not recommend approval of item #1, the removal of flower boxes, based on finding d. If the applicant can demonstrate that the boxes, as a design element, are not original, then they may be removed.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Sarah Gould spoke in opposition to the case.
- Bianca Maldonado spoke in opposition to the case.
 - Tom Simmons yielded his time to Bianca Maldonado.
 - Drea Garza yielded her time to Bianca Maldonado.
- Jan Peranteau submitted a voicemail in opposition to the case.

MOTION: Commissioner Vasquez moved to approve with staff recommendations.
Commissioner Flores seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Flores, Setser, Fullerton, Smith, Vasquez, and Sepulveda.
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Burgard

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES. 0 NAYS. 1 ABSENT.**

ITEM 7. HDRC NO. 2024-036
ADDRESS: 1120 IOWA ST
APPLICANT: Michael San Antonio Texas/ELIZONDO MICHAEL & SANDRA

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace 7 existing wood windows with fully wood windows.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff does not recommend approval based on findings a through e.

If the HDRC is compelled to approve window replacement, staff recommends the following stipulation:

- i. That the applicant installs fully wood windows that meet staff's standard window stipulations and submits updated specifications to staff for review and approval. The windows should feature an inset of two (2) inches within facades and should feature profiles that are found historically within the immediate vicinity. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening. Faux divided lites are not permitted.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

MOTION: Commissioner Vasquez moved to refer to the Design Review Committee.
Commissioner Setser seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Flores, Setser, Fullerton, Smith, Vasquez, and Sepulveda.
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Burgard

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES. 0 NAYS. 1 ABSENT.**

ITEM 8. HDRC NO. 2024-073
ADDRESS: 3502 BROADWAY
APPLICANT: Louis Talamantez/LT Electric, LLC

REQUEST:

The applicant requests a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Install signage, including an internally illuminated sign mounted on a 12'x4' backing and window vinyl featuring the business logo in four locations.
2. Install under-eave lighting along the primary elevation of the building.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of signage, based on findings a through d, with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant reduces signage to no more than three signs that are equal to or less than 50 square feet in total, as noted in finding b. This includes reduction of window clings to conform with signage standards, as noted in finding c.
- ii. That the applicant proposes under-eave lighting that conforms to UDC 35.673, namely lighting that is shielded to reduce glare and with a lighting temperature that meets RIO standards, as noted in finding d.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

MOTION: Commissioner Flores moved to approve with staff recommendations.
Commissioner Fullerton seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Flores, Setser, Fullerton, Smith, Vasquez, and Sepulveda.
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Burgard

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES. 0 NAYS. 1 ABSENT.**

ITEM 9. HDRC NO. 2024-024
ADDRESS: 102 HEIMAN/including 104 Heiman
APPLICANT: Michael Abner/Smart Concepts Construction, LLC

REQUEST:

The applicant requests a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace existing metal casement and sash windows with fixed four-, six-, eight-, and 12-lite metal windows or four-over-four metal windows.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the request to replace windows, based on findings a through d, with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant proposes to either return the windows to their previous conditions or, based on the age of the building, propose installation of wood or aluminum-clad wood sash windows across all elevations, as noted in finding c.
- ii. That if a wood or aluminum-clad wood window product is proposed, the product must meet staff's standard window stipulations, and the applicant must submit updated specifications to staff for review and approval. The windows should feature an inset of two (2) inches within facades and should feature profiles that are found historically within the immediate vicinity. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.
- iii. Windows should be custom to fit existing masonry openings, as noted in finding d. Firing in of the openings to fit stock sizes is not appropriate.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

MOTION: Commissioner Vasquez moved to approve with staff recommendations.
Commissioner Flores seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Flores, Setser, Fullerton, Smith, Vasquez, and Sepulveda.
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Burgard

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES. 0 NAYS. 1 ABSENT.**

ITEM 10. HDRC NO. 2024-037
ADDRESS: 219 LAVACA ST
APPLICANT: CHISCA CO LLC

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Remove the existing six one-over-one sashed wood windows and replace them with one fixed window on the rear (north) elevation.
2. Replace two existing doors with Craftsman doors on the front (south) elevation.

RECOMMENDATION:

Item 1, staff does not recommend approval of the removal of the six wood windows and replacement with one fixed window, based on finding c.

Item 2, staff does not recommend approval of the installation of Craftsman doors, based on finding d. Staff recommends that a wood, architecturally appropriate door be installed instead, such as the previously-approved door noted in the findings.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

MOTION: Commissioner Vasquez moved to deny the request.
Commissioner Setser seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Flores, Setser, Fullerton, Smith, Vasquez, and Sepulveda.
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Burgard

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES. 0 NAYS. 1 ABSENT.**

ITEM 11. POSTPONED PRIOR TO HEARING

ITEM 12. HDRC NO. 2024-034
ADDRESS: 626 BURNET ST
APPLICANT: Richard Gonzalez/CHAPAWU PROPERTIES LLC

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to:

1. Install a 4-foot-tall front yard, wood-frame cattle panel fence and horizontal wood front yard fencing exceeding 4 feet in height.
2. Remove the front walkways and install walkway pavers at the front entrance on the east side of the facade.
3. Remove the chimney.
4. Replace the front, rear, and side lawn with gravel.

RECOMMENDATION:

Item 1, staff recommends approval of the front yard fence installation based on finding c with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant installs a front yard fence material that is consistent with the fence material and design found in the immediate context. Updated material specifications must be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- ii. That the final construction height of the approved fencing may not exceed the maximum height of 4 feet as approved by the HDRC at any portion of the fence in front of the front façade wall plane. Additionally, the fencing must be permitted and meet the development standards outlined in UDC Section 35-514.

Items 2-4, staff does not recommend approval based on findings d through f. Staff recommends the following:

- i. That the applicant installs two front walkways to match the previously existing walkways in location, material, alignment, configuration, and width based on finding d. The applicant is required to submit a measured site plan and material specifications to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- ii. That the applicant reconstructs the chimney to match the previously existing in material, dimensions, and detail. The applicant is required to submit detailed measured drawings and material specifications to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- iii. That the applicant installs at least 50% of native plantings and natural-colored ground cover to comply with the Historic Design Guidelines. An updated landscaping plan, material specifications, and list of native plantings to be used must be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Voicemail from Lulu Francois, on behalf of the Dignowity Hill Architectural Review Committee in support of staff recommendations.
- Letter from the Dignowity Hill Architectural Review Committee with same the information provided in their voicemail.

MOTION: Commissioner Flores moved to approve with staff recommendations.
Commissioner Vasquez seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Flores, Setser, Fullerton, Smith, Vasquez, and Sepulveda.
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Burgard

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES. 0 NAYS. 1 ABSENT.**

ITEM 13. HDRC NO. 2024-045
ADDRESS: 504 N HACKBERRY ST
APPLICANT: Richard Gonzalez/CHAPAWU PROPERTIES LLC

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Install a front yard cattle-panel fence with a pedestrian and driveway gate.
2. Replace the front porch steps.
3. Replace the front porch decking.
4. Remove the existing chimney.
5. Replace wholesale the wood windows on the property.
6. Modify the existing fenestration pattern.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of items 1 through 3, based on findings a though h, with the following stipulations:

- i. That the fence and gates height does not exceed four feet.
- ii. That the driveway gate be placed behind the front façade of the main structure.
- iii. That the applicant install 1x3” wood tongue and groove porch decking running perpendicular to the front façade with a slight slope toward the front yard.

Staff does not recommend approval of items 4 through 6 based on findings a and i through p. Staff recommends the applicant restore the previous conditions which includes the chimney reconstruction and wood windows, with trim, in the same historic fenestration pattern (sizes and locations of openings).

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Voicemail from Lulu Francois, on behalf of the Dignowity Hill Architectural Review Committee, in support of staff recommendations.
- Letter from the Dignowity Hill Architectural Review Committee with same the information provided in their voicemail.

MOTION: Commissioner Flores moved to approve with staff recommendations.
Commissioner Vasquez seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Flores, Setser, Fullerton, Smith, Vasquez, and Sepulveda.
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Burgard

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES. 0 NAYS. 1 ABSENT.**

ADJOURNMENT: Chair Sepulveda adjourned the meeting at 11:03 a.m.

APPROVED:

Juanita Sepulveda, Chair
Compliance and Technical Advisory Board
City of San Antonio

Date: _____