

City of San Antonio



Minutes

Audit Committee

2023 – 2025 Council Members

Chair: Phyllis Viagran, District 3

John Courage, District 9 | Marc Whyte, Dist. 10

Citizen Representative Judy Trevino and Philip M. Harris

Tuesday, November 14, 2023

10:00 AM

**Council Briefing Room at
City Hall Complex**

The Audit Committee convened a regular meeting in the City Hall Council Briefing Room beginning at 10:00 AM. City Clerk Debbie Racca-Sittre took the Roll Call noting a quorum with the following Committee Members present:

Members Present: Phyllis Viagran, *Chair*
John Courage, *Member*
Marc Whyte, *Member*
Judy Trevino, *Citizen Member*
Philip Harris, *Citizen Member*

Members Absent: None

Approval of Minutes

1. Approval of minutes from the October 10, 2023 Audit Committee Meeting

Citizen Member Harris moved to Approve the minutes of the October 10, 2023 Audit and Accountability Committee meeting. Councilmember Courage seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Harris
Absent: Trevino

Public Comments

There were no members of the public signed up to speak.

CONSENT AGENDA

Final Internal Audit Reports

2. Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor Report AU23-021 Audit of ITSD Security Awareness Training [Kevin W. Barthold, City Auditor]

Councilmember Whyte moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Councilmember Courage seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Harris
Absent: Trevino

3. Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor Report AU22-005 Audit of Citywide Contractor Pools [Kevin W. Barthold, City Auditor]

Councilmember Whyte moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Councilmember Courage seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Harris
Absent: Trevino

4. Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor Report AU23-028 Audit of NHSD Tax Increment Reinvestment Zones [Kevin W. Barthold, City Auditor]

Councilmember Whyte moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Councilmember Courage seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Harris
Absent: Trevino

5. Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor Report AU23-024 Audit of ITSD Contract Administration [Kevin W. Barthold, City Auditor]

Councilmember Whyte moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Councilmember Courage seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Harris
Absent: Trevino

ITEMS FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

Pre-Solicitation High Profile Briefings

- 6. Briefing on the release of a solicitation for up to two contracts to provide the Center City Development & Operations Department with a comprehensive parking technology solution for off- street garages and lots along with optimization for on-street parking areas in the estimated total value of \$7,000,000 for 5 years with 2, 1-year options to renew.** [Lori

Houston, Assistant City Manager; John Jacks, Director, Center City Development & Operations]

John Jacks, Director of Center City Development & Operations Department (CCDO), provided an overview of the contract which was to replace an existing parking technology system with a newer, more efficient system. Jacks listed the evaluation panelists and criteria. He noted that the Local Preference Program and Veteran's Small Business Program were not applicable. He stated that there was a 6% Small Business Enterprise (SBE) goal under the Small Business Economic Development Advocacy (SBEDA) Program. Jacks provided a timeline for the solicitation which was expected to take eight months.

Chair Viagran spoke in support of improved technology and increased parking revenues.

Councilmember Courage clarified that the system that tracked all of the downtown parking spaces was being replaced and requested that the new system allow customers to know where vacant spaces were available. Jacks stated that while the old system was very manual, new technology would help CCDO advertise where parking was available to help facilitate the public but this technology would not be on a space by space availability, rather, a capacity level for downtown parking and did not include the Alamodome lot. Councilmember Courage recommended providing information to the public through cell phone applications and signage. Jacks stated that the applications were a part of the solicitation request but signage would be a larger challenge.

Chair Viagran asked if there was specific technology available for staff to use at City Tower garage noting that staff were guaranteed parking and might leave and come back. Jacks replied that the system would help get people in and out of the garage more easily. Chair Viagran requested a separate discussion if the timeline got delayed.

Item was for briefing only so no action was taken.

- 7. Briefing on the release of a solicitation for up to six contracts to provide the Public Works Department with On-Call Construction Inspection Services for bond funded and other City funded projects for an estimated total value of \$15,000,000 for three years with two, one-year renewal options.** [Roderick Sanchez, Assistant City Manager; Razi Hosseini, Director, Public Works Department]

Assistant Public Works Director, Christie Chapman provided an overview of three solicitations for on-call construction inspection services for three to five years. Chapman listed the evaluation panelists and criteria and stated that the Public Works Department was seeking approval to release a Request for Qualifications (RFQ) for up to six firms to provide timely inspection services for bond funded, and other City funded projects. She indicated that these services would include but not limited to the Storm Water Pollution Prevention Plan (SWPPP) best management practices, attendance at preconstruction and on-site construction meetings, plan and specification compliance and coordination with City staff, contractors, etc.

Chapman noted that the Local Preference Program and Veteran's Small Business Program were not applicable. He stated that there was a 21% Small Business Enterprise (SBE) goal. Chapman

concluded her presentation by providing a timeline for the solicitation which was expected to culminate in City Council action in April 2024 when the current contracts expired.

Councilmember Courage asked how many inspectors the City currently had since we were looking for six and asked how long we had them. Chapman stated that the City currently had six firms and would provide the Councilmember with more history. Councilmember Courage wanted to ensure that we considered new vendors.

Chair Viagran requested outreach information or a flyer so her office could help get the word out about the solicitation.

Item was for briefing only so no action was taken.

8. Briefing on the release of a solicitation for one contract to provide Construction Manager At Risk Pre-Construction and Construction Phase Services for the Dolorosa Street Reconstruction Project. [Roderick Sanchez, Assistant City Manager; Razi Hosseini, Director, Public Works]

Assistant Public Works Director Luis Maltos provided an overview of the contract which was to provide pre-construction and construction services through the Construction Manager at Risk (CMR) for the Dolorosa Street Reconstruction Project. Maltos listed the evaluation panelists and criteria. He noted that the Local Preference Program and Veteran's Small Business Program were not applicable. He noted that there were 10 points for Small Business Enterprise (SBE) and the subcontracting requirements were 19% for MWBE and 3% for AABE along with participation in the Mentor-Protege Program. Maltos provided a timeline for the solicitation which was expected to take five months.

Councilmember Courage noted that Public Works had been working on Commerce Street for a long time and now, construction would shift north to Dolorosa and expressed concern with how long Dolorosa street might also be under construction. Maltos stated that a typical project of this size would normally take 18-24 months but the CMR delivery method was selected to allow the contractor to accelerate and adjust.

Councilmember Courage asked if there was anticipated developer projects also planned for the area during the construction period. Maltos confirmed that there was private development expected in the area so the CMR process could help

Councilmember Whyte supported using CMR to speed up the process.

Chair Viagran agreed that using CMR would allow the City to be more flexible and keep the streets open.

Item was for briefing only so no action was taken.

Post-Solicitation High Profile Briefings

9. **Approval to proceed with scheduling one contract for City Council consideration to provide Custodial Services for Various City Facilities with an estimated total value of \$8,166,556.00 for an initial three-year term with two, one-year options to renew.**[Lori Houston, Assistant City Manager; Melody Woosley, Director, Human Services]

Assistant Department of Human Services (DHS) Director, Jessica Dovalina provided an overview of a Request for Competitive Sealed Proposals (RFCSP) solicitation which was for a contract to provide custodial services at multiple City facilities including DHS, the San Antonio Fire Department (SAFD), the San Antonio Police Department (SAPD), the Solid Waste Management Department (SWMD), the Public Works Department (PW), the Information Technology Services Department (ITSD) and the World Heritage Office.

She reported that custodial services included: all cleaning and custodial maintenance supplies and commercial equipment necessary to ensure the facilities were uniformly clean, hygienic, orderly, and attractive. Dovalina reported that 13 vendors submitted responses; one was non-responsive, two withdrew, and 10 were evaluated. Dovalina listed the evaluation panelists and criteria. She recommended approval of the highest scoring vendor.

Chair Viagran asked whether there would be an interruption in service. Dovalina stated that the current contract would end on December 31, 2023 and the new contract would take effect January 1, 2024 so no service interruption was expected.

Councilmember Courage asked why there had not been any interviews conducted for the solicitation. Dovalina stated that the panelists came to consensus on their scores, SBEDA and pricing were added in and there was a clear winner. Councilmember Courage asked how often interviews were held. Deputy Chief Financial Officer, Troy Elliott, stated that 70% of the time there were interviews but when there was a clear winner, there was no reason to interview.

Citizen Member Trevino asked what the acronym ESBE meant. Dovalina replied that the firms who received those 10 points qualified as Emerging Small Business Enterprises. Citizen Member Trevino noted that experience and proposal were weighted heavier and it appeared that the top two vendors both scored high. Dovalina stated that the top two vendors were both good companies that would be recognizable, but the top ranked firm simply edged out the firms that got the ESBE points.

Citizen Member Harris moved to Approve. Councilmember Courage seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Trevino, Harris

10. **Approval to proceed with scheduling a contract for City Council consideration to provide the San Antonio Public Library with Custodial Services with an estimated total value of \$7,500,000 for initial three years with two, one-year options to renew.** [David McCary, Assistant City Manager; Ramiro S. Salazar, Director, Library Department]

Assistant San Antonio Public Library (SAPL) Director, Dale McNeill, provided an overview of the contract which was expected to provide custodial services at 27 library branches. McNeill stated

that nine vendors submitted responses; four were deemed non-responsive due to not meeting the SBEDA subcontracting requirements; five were evaluated using the established criteria; the Evaluation Committee selected four vendors to interview and rescored ratings resulting in one top vendor that would be recommended to City Council for consideration.

Chair Viagran noted the need for cleanliness at the libraries and this was an important contract for our community.

Councilmember Courage noted that this solicitation included an interview process and suggested that there should be more consistency since the last custodial contract did not. Elliott stated that the two solicitations were very different and the proposers were different as well as the evaluation panel. Assistant City Manager David McCary noted that the top four vendors were all very good so it was necessary to have an interview to get the best. Councilmember Courage recommended more consistency and a debriefing of those firms that were not selected.

Chair Viagran supported not calling vendors in for interviews but to simply to check a box if the panel was sure about the top ranking firm.

Citizen Member Harris moved to Approve. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Trevino, Harris

- 11. Approval to proceed with scheduling three contracts for City Council consideration to provide the Public Works Department Storm Water Division with On-Call Storm Water Civil Engineering Services in the estimated total value of \$20,000,000 for an initial three-year term with two, one- year options to renew. [Roderick Sanchez, Assistant City Manager; Razi Hosseini, Director, Public Works Department]**

Assistant Public Works Director Christie Chapman stated that the on-call contracts would provide engineering design and construction documents for drainage projects. Chapman explained that the current on-call contracts expired in September 2023 but the current engineering firms continued to work on the projects that were tasked before the expiration.

Chapman reported that the Request for Qualifications (RFQ) was released in July 2023 and 22 proposals were received with three firms being recommended.

Chair Viagran asked why the Local Preference Program was not applied. Elliott stated that State Law prohibited the use of the Local Preference Program on engineering contracts. Chair Viagran requested a timeline for when the contracts would begin. Chapman stated that once City Council approved the contracts, the firms could be tasked and each task order had an assigned schedule.

Citizen Member Harris moved to Approve. Councilmember Courage seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Trevino, Harris

12. Approval to proceed with scheduling eight contracts for City Council consideration to provide the Public Works Department with On-Call Civil Engineering Services in the estimated total value of \$24,000,000 for a three-year term. [Roderick Sanchez, Assistant City Manager; Razi Hosseini, Director, Public Works Department]

Assistant Public Works Director, Christie Chapman, stated that the on-call contracts would provide engineering design and construction documents for street and sidewalk projects. Chapman explained that the current on-call contracts expired in August 2023 but the current engineering firms continued to work on the projects that were tasked before the expiration.

Chapman reported that the Request for Qualifications (RFQ) was released in July 2023 and 38 proposals were received with eight firms being recommended. She added that all proposals met the 19% SBEDA Subcontracting Requirement.

There was no discussion by the Committee.

Citizen Member Trevino moved to Approve. Citizen Member Harris seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Trevino, Harris

Consideration of items for future meetings

Next Scheduled Meeting Date: December 12, 2023

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 10:54 a.m.

Approved

Phyllis Viagran, Chair

Debbie Racca-Sittre, City Clerk