



**CITY OF SAN ANTONIO
OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION**

**HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES
WEDNESDAY, APRIL 3, 2024**

The City of San Antonio Historic and Design Review Commission (“HDRC”) met on Wednesday, April 3, 2024, at 1901 South Alamo Street, San Antonio, Texas 78204.

MEETING CALLED TO ORDER:

Chairman Gibbs called the meeting to order at 3:01 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

PRESENT: Castillo, Savino, Velásquez, Mazuca, Guevara, Cervantes (virtual), Fetzer, and Gibbs.

ABSENT: Galloway, Grube, and Holland.

- Commissioner Holland arrived at 3:04 p.m.
- Commissioner Grube arrived at 3:15 p.m.

CHAIR’S STATEMENT:

Chairman Gibbs provided a statement regarding meeting processes, appeals, time limits, decorum.

ANNOUNCEMENT:

- Spanish interpreter services available to the public during the hearing.
- Item 9 was pulled from the consent agenda for individual consideration at the applicant's request.

APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

MOTION: Commissioner Fetzer moved to approve HDRC meeting minutes for March 20, 2024. Commissioner Velásquez seconded the motion.

VOTE:

AYE:	Castillo, Savino, Velásquez, Mazuca, Guevara, Cervantes, Holland, Fetzer, and Gibbs.
NAY:	None.
ABSENT:	Galloway and Grube.

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 9 AYES. 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT.**

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

- Item 4 – Lisa Nungesser submitted a letter with comments.
- Item 6 – The Monte Vista Neighborhood Association Architectural Review Committee submitted a letter in support of staff recommendations.
- Item 9 – Katherine Noll submitted a letter in support of the request.
- Item 9 – The Monte Vista Neighborhood Association Architectural Review Committee submitted a letter in support of staff recommendations.
- Item 9 – Pat De Winne submitted a letter in support of the request.

Chairman Gibbs asked if any commissioner would like to pull items from the Consent Agenda. Commissioner Fetzer requested Item 4 be pulled from the Consent Agenda for individual consideration. Commissioner Fetzer recused from voting on the consent agenda.

CONSENT AGENDA:

Item 1, Case No. 2024-119	600 HEMISFAIR PLAZA WAY
Item 2, Case No. 2024-121	217 NEWELL
Item 3, Case No. 2024-120	1210 E ELMIRA ST
Item 5, Case No. 2024-137	125 LEIGH ST
Item 6, Case No. 2024-090	120 E MAGNOLIA AVE
Item 7, Case No. 2024-110	134 E MULBERRY AVE
Item 8, Case No. 2024-133	523 E HUISACHE AVE
Item 9, Case No. 2024-132	314 W SUMMIT AVE

MOTION: Commissioner Holland moved to approve items 1-3 and 5-9 with staff stipulations.
Commissioner Castillo seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Castillo, Savino, Velásquez, Mazuca, Guevara, Cervantes, Holland, and Gibbs.
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Galloway and Grube.
RECUSE: Fetzer

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 8 AYES. 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT. 1 RECUSAL.**

INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION ITEMS:

ITEM 4. HDRC NO. 2024-122
ADDRESS: 221 Losoya
APPLICANT: Kyle Tostenson/kyle tostenson architects

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to:

1. Replace all existing fifth level wood windows with new, wood windows. The existing wood windows are not original to the structure.
2. Remove four (4) existing, non-original windows to create an open air terrace at the rear of the structure. Three windows are on the west (rear) façade and one is on the south facade. The original window trim will be repaired and will remain in place. The opening size will not change.
3. Open (4) previously enclosed windows on the north façade.
4. Construct a balcony within a recessed on the south façade. To facilitate access to the balcony, the applicant has proposed to modify one (1) original window opening to a door opening.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends conceptual approval of items #1 through #4 based on findings a through e with the following stipulations:

- i. That the profile of all new windows match the original windows (found on lower floors) in profile and installation depth, as noted in finding b.
- ii. That the openings at the proposed open air terrace maintain their original wood trim and openings size, as noted in finding c.
- iii. That the previously enclosed openings feature window trim and window installation depths that match the original, as noted in finding d.
- iv. That all elements of the proposed balcony be recessed as to not extend out past the primary façade plane on the south façade and that an architecturally appropriate door should be installed, as noted in finding e. Construction documents of the proposed balcony are to be submitted for review and approval when returning to the Commission for final approval.

PUBLIC COMMENT: Provided at the beginning of the meeting.

MOTION: Commissioner Fetzer moved to approve the request with staff stipulations.
Commissioner Savino seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Castillo, Savino, Velásquez, Mazuca, Guevara, Cervantes, Holland, Fetzer, and Gibbs.
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Galloway and Grube.

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 9 AYES. 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT.**

ITEM 9. HDRC NO. 2024-132
ADDRESS: 314 W SUMMIT AVE
APPLICANT: Grant Garbo

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Modify the existing topography of the front yard by removing the slope.
2. Install a 2.5-foot-tall brick retaining wall.

RECOMMENDATION:

Item 1, staff does not recommend approval of the modifications to the topography based on finding b.

Item 2, staff does not recommend approval of the retaining wall installation based on finding c. Minimal curbing installed at the sidewalk to prevent erosion and may be eligible for administrative approval.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Katherine Noll submitted a letter in support of the request.
- The Monte Vista Neighborhood Association Architectural Review Committee submitted a letter in support of staff's recommendation to deny a retaining wall but suggested that the applicant consider a small "curb", possibly the height of one or two bricks, in line with the staff recommendations.
- Pat De Winne submitted a letter in support of the request.
- Stephen and Shannan Kinsley submitted a letter in support of the request.

MOTION 1: Commissioner Velásquez moved to approve the request as requested by the applicant.
Commissioner Cervantes seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Velásquez, Mazuca, Guevara, and Cervantes.
(Motion 1) NAY: Castillo, Savino, Grube, Holland, Fetzer, and Gibbs.
ABSENT: Galloway.

ACTION: **MOTION FAILED with 4 AYES. 6 NAYS. 1 ABSENT.**

MOTION 2: Commissioner Holland moved to approve the request with staff stipulations.
Commissioner Cervantes seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Castillo, Savino, Velásquez, Mazuca, Guevara, Grube, Holland, Fetzer, and Gibbs.
(Motion 2) NAY: Cervantes.
ABSENT: Galloway.

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 9 AYES. 1 NAY. 1 ABSENT.**

ITEM 10. HDRC NO. 2024-126
ADDRESS: 232 CAMARGO
APPLICANT: Fernando Morales/Candid Works PLLC

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace the existing chain link fence along the north and east portions of the property with a steel framed cattle-panel fence.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the request, based on findings a through f, with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant install a front yard cattle-panel fence to not exceed four feet in height and feature wood framing.
- ii. That the applicant install a side yard cattle-panel fence to not exceed six feet in height, feature wood framing, and placed behind the front façade of the primary structure.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Melissa Stendahl on behalf of the Lavaca Neighborhood Association submitted a voicemail in support of the request.

MOTION: Commissioner Grube moved to approve the request as submitted by the applicant.
Commissioner Velásquez seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Castillo, Savino, Velásquez, Mazuca, Guevara, Grube,
Cervantes, Holland, Fetzer, and Gibbs.
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Galloway.

ACTION: MOTION PASSED with 10 AYES. 0 NAYS. 1 ABSENT.

ITEM 11. HDRC NO. 2024-128
ADDRESS: 224 LAVACA ST
APPLICANT: Douglas Long/CandidWorks

REQUEST:

The applicant requests a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a 15'8"x20' detached steel and wood carport in front of the house.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff does not recommend approval of the request to construct a steel and wood carport in front of the house, based on findings a through d.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

MOTION: Commissioner Grube moved to deny the request.
Commissioner Savino seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Castillo, Savino, Mazuca, Guevara, Grube, Cervantes, Holland, Fetzer, and Gibbs.
NAY: Velásquez.
ABSENT: Galloway.

ACTION: MOTION PASSED with 9 AYES. 1 NAY. 1 ABSENT.

ADJOURNMENT: Chairman Gibbs adjourned the meeting at 5:40 p.m.

APPROVED

J. Maurice Gibbs, Chair
Historic Design Review Commission
City of San Antonio

Date: _____