

# City of San Antonio



## Minutes Audit Committee

**2023 – 2025 Council Members**

Chair: Phyllis Viagran, District 3

John Courage, District 9 | Marc Whyte, Dist. 10

Citizen Representative Judy Trevino and Philip M. Harris

---

**Thursday, December 14, 2023**

**10:00 AM**

**City Hall**

---

The Audit Committee convened a regular meeting in the City Hall Council Briefing Room beginning at 10:03 AM. City Clerk Debbie Racca-Sittre took the Roll Call noting a quorum with the following Committee Members present:

**Members Present:** Phyllis Viagran, *Chair*  
John Courage, *Member*  
Marc Whyte, *Member*  
Dr. Judy Trevino, *Citizen Member*  
Philip Harris, *Citizen Member*

**Members Absent:** None

### Approval of Minutes

#### 1. Approval of minutes from the November 14, 2023 Audit Committee Meeting

Councilmember Courage moved to Approve the minutes of the November 14, 2023 Audit Committee meeting. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Viagran, Courage, Trevino, Harris

**Absent:** Whyte

### Public Comments

### CONSENT AGENDA

## **Final Internal Audit Reports**

### **2. Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor Report AU23-030 Audit of SAPD Growden and Towing Contracts [Kevin W. Barthold, City Auditor]**

Citizen Member Trevino moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Citizen Member Harris seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Viagran, Courage, Trevino, Harris  
**Absent:** Whyte

### **3. Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor Report AU23-008 Audit of DSD Southern Edwards Habitat Conservation Plan (SEP-HCP) [Kevin W. Barthold, City Auditor]**

Citizen Member Trevino moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Citizen Member Harris seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Viagran, Courage, Trevino, Harris  
**Absent:** Whyte

## **ITEMS FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION**

### **Pre-Solicitation High Profile Briefings**

#### **4. Briefing on the release of a solicitation for multiple contracts to provide the Parks and Recreation Department with mowing services in the estimated total value of \$13,000,000 for 3 years with 2, 1-year options to renew. [David W. McCary, Assistant City Manager; Homer Garcia III, Director, Parks and Recreation]**

Homer Garcia, Director of the Parks and Recreation Department, introduced Michael Baldwin, Operations Manager who presented an overview of the solicitation for services to mow various City parks, trailheads, greenway trails and sports fields. Baldwin noted that there was no tree maintenance included in the contract. He described the outreach process and listed the evaluation panelists as well as the evaluation criteria. He added that the solicitation included 10 points each for Small Business Enterprise (SBE) prime and Minority/Woman Owned Business Enterprise (M/WBE) prime with a 16% SMWBE subcontracting goal. Baldwin concluded his presentation by providing a timeline for the solicitation.

Chair Viagran supported the 10 points for SBE and M/WBE prime and asked whether the Local Preference Program (LPP) could be applied. Deputy Chief Financial Officer Troy Elliott, stated that the contract was not eligible for LPP.

Chair Viagran asked if the mowing scheduled would be included on the dashboard and if there was a means to control quality. Baldwin stated that mowing services were on a 21, 14, or 7 day mowing cycle and it fluctuated due to weather so there was no plan to develop a public dashboard, however, the staff monitored the contract and its deliverables regularly.

Councilmember Courage asked how the Mentor/Protege Program worked. Michael Sindon, Small Business Administrator with the Economic Development Department explained the requirements of the Program.

Citizen Member Dr. Judy Trevino stated that the department was doing a good job mowing.

Councilmember Whyte asked whether there was any discussion regarding robotic mowing and recommended Renu Robotics. Baldwin stated that there was a pilot project for mowing on steep slopes that were unsafe for people, however, waste on the ground and cost of equipment could be a barrier so more evaluation needed to be performed.

**5. Briefing on the release of a solicitation for at least 10 contracts for vaccine hesitancy outreach services for the San Antonio Metropolitan Health District in the estimated total value of \$1,080,000 for a 1-year term.** [Erik Walsh, City Manager; Claude A. Jacob, Director, Health]

Director of Metro Health, Dr. Claude Jacob, provided an overview of the concern that many persons were choosing not to get themselves or their children vaccinated. Jacob stated that the goal of the program was to outreach the community using trusted organizations and media to allow members of the public to make informed decisions about vaccination.

Jacob described the outreach process and listed the evaluation panelists as well as evaluation criteria. Jacob concluded his presentation by providing a timeline for the solicitation.

Chair Viagran recommended identification of gaps/key areas of the City as well as school districts that had low levels of vaccination. Chair Viagran looked forward to getting some robust proposals for the outreach services.

Councilmember Courage suggested that there needed to be an educational component regarding the benefits of immunizations. While he respected individual choice, he felt the role of Metro Health was to educate and promote public health and vaccinations. Councilmember Courage recommended adding a school district representative to the evaluation panel.

Councilmember Whyte asked how many years the City had been performing vaccination outreach efforts. Dr. Anita Kurian, Metro Health Assistant Director, stated that the outreach activities had been performed since 1994 and he noted that anti-vaccine sentiments had increased since the COVID-19 Pandemic. Councilmember Whyte asked about the \$1 million price tag. Dr. Kurian stated that the funding was from a Federal grant to be used for outreach.

Chair Viagran clarified that the focus was not only on the COVID vaccine but other childhood illnesses that we thought were eradicated and asked which diseases had spiked recently as a result of vaccine hesitancy. Kurian confirmed that the outreach was for all vaccinations since there was an increase in non-medical exemptions and there had been a spike in measles.

Chair Viagran recommended outreach for multiple generations and not only children as there were many multi-generational homes on the south side.

6. **Briefing on the release of a solicitation for one contract to provide Construction Manager at Risk Pre-Construction and Construction services for the Carver Branch Library Renovation project for the estimated total value of \$8,000,000 for the project duration.** [Roderick Sanchez, Assistant City Manager; Razi Hosseini, Director, Public Works]

Director of Public Works Razi Hosseini noted that the project was funded by the 2022 Bond and the selected project delivery method was Construction Manager at Risk (CMAR). He described the outreach process and listed the evaluation panelists as well as the evaluation criteria. He noted that the solicitation included five points each for SBE and M/WBE prime with 18% SMWBE and 3% African American Business Enterprise (AABE) subcontracting goals. He stated that Mentor/Protege Program participation was required. Hosseini concluded his presentation by providing a timeline for the solicitation.

Chair Viagran clarified that LPP and Veteran's Owned Business Programs were not applicable due to State Law but noted that there were many local businesses interested in the project. Hosseini confirmed that most likely a local firm would be awarded the project.

Councilmember Courage suggested that this was one of the first CMAR contracts for a mid sized project and noted that the benefits of CMAR was that the contractor would work with the designer to ensure constructability. Hosseini added that the main benefit of CMAR was the ability of the CMAR to break the project into smaller packages and encourage more small business participation.

Councilmember Courage requested clarification on the two phased approach to the solicitation. Hosseini stated that the first phase was based solely on qualifications and the second phase was based on pricing.

7. **Briefing on the release of a solicitation for one contract to provide Construction Manager at Risk Pre-Construction and Construction services for the Ella Austin Community Center Renovation project for the estimated total value of \$17,200,000 for the project duration.** [Roderick Sanchez, Assistant City Manager; Razi Hosseini, Director, Public Works]

Director of Public Works, Razi Hosseini, noted that the project was funded by the 2022 Bond Program and the selected project delivery method was Construction Manager at Risk (CMAR). He described the outreach process and listed the evaluation panelists as well as the evaluation criteria. Hosseini stated that the solicitation included five points each for SBE and M/WBE prime with 20% SMWBE and 3% AABE subcontracting goals. He noted that Mentor/Protege Program participation was required. Hosseini concluded his presentation by providing a timeline for the solicitation.

Chair Viagran asked if the project was considered for the solar project. Hosseini stated that the Office of Sustainability had been engaged to review all building projects and as much green building components as possible would be included.

Councilmember Whyte clarified that there were points allocated to experience with the San Antonio Region and Past Performance on Item 6 but not on Item 7 and requested clarification on

how they might get those points.

Chair Viagran clarified that LPP and Veteran's Owned Business Programs were not applicable due to State Law but noted there were many local businesses interested in the project. Hosseini confirmed that most likely a local firm would receive the award.

### **Consideration of items for future meetings**

Next Scheduled Meeting Date: January 9, 2024

Councilmember Whyte requested a briefing on the high profile process and ideas to streamline. Chief Financial Officer, Ben Gorzell, stated that if the Chair wanted a briefing or recommendation on streamlining the process, he would provide it.

Chair Viagran stated that she would meet with staff and consider the item for the next agenda.

### **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 10:47 a.m.

**Approved**

---

*Phyllis Viagran, Chair*

*Debbie Racca-Sittre, City Clerk*