

# City of San Antonio



## Minutes Audit and Accountability Meeting

### 2021 – 2023 Council Members

Clayton Perry, Dist. 10

Jalen McKee-Rodriguez, Dist. 2

Manny Pelaez, Dist. 8

---

**Friday, August 26, 2022**

**10:00 AM**

**City Hall**

---

The Audit and Accountability Committee convened a regular meeting in City Hall beginning at 10:09 AM. Deputy City Clerk Aurora Perkins took the Roll Call noting a quorum with the following Committee Members present:

**Members Present:** Clayton Perry, *Chair*  
Jalen McKee-Rodriguez, *Member*  
Manny Pelaez, *Member*  
Judy Trevino, *Citizen Member*

**Members Absent:** None

### Approval of Minutes

#### 1. Approval of minutes from the June 3, 2022 and June 13, 2022 Audit and Accountability Meetings.

Citizen Member Trevino moved to Approve the minutes from the June 3, 2022 and June 13, 2022 Audit and Accountability Committee meetings. Councilmember Pelaez seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Perry, Pelaez, Trevino  
**Absent:** McKee-Rodriguez

### Public Comment

Chief Apostle Hester spoke on Item 2 and the need for sidewalk mobility accessibility and

improvements for all disabled individuals.

## **CONSENT AGENDA**

### **Pre-Solicitation High Profile Items**

2. **Briefing on the release of a solicitation for up to three contracts to provide the Public Works Department with On-Call Civil Engineering Services for the Infrastructure Management Plan (IMP) and the Neighborhood Access and Mobility Program (NAMP) in the estimated total value of \$14,250,000.00; \$950,000 annually per contractor, for three years with two, 1-year options to renew.** [Roderick Sanchez, Assistant City Manager; Razi Hosseini, Director, Public Works Department]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Perry, Pelaez, Trevino  
**Absent:** McKee-Rodriguez

### **Post-Solicitation High Profile Items**

3. **Approval to proceed with scheduling two contracts for City Council consideration to provide the Animal Care Services Department with relief veterinarian services in the estimated total value of \$3,432,275.00 for 3 years with 2, 1-year options to renew.** [David W. McCary, Assistant City Manager; Shannon Sims, Director, Animal Care Services]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Perry, Pelaez, Trevino  
**Absent:** McKee-Rodriguez

4. **Approval to proceed with scheduling one contract for City Council consideration to provide the Building and Equipment Services Department and other City departments with a Texas licensed elevator and escalator preventive maintenance contract in the estimated total value of \$3,000,000.00 for 3 years with 2, 1-year options to renew.** [Roderick Sanchez, Assistant City Manager; Jorge A. Perez, Director, Building and Equipment Services]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Perry, Pelaez, Trevino  
**Absent:** McKee-Rodriguez

5. **Approval to proceed with scheduling one contract for City Council consideration to provide the Convention & Sports Facilities Department with an annual contract for Event Attendant & Supplemental Event Security Services for the Alamodome in the estimated total value of \$15,000,000.00 for 3 years with 2, 1-year options to renew.** [Alejandra Lopez, Assistant City Manager; Patricia Muzquiz Cantor, Executive Director, Convention & Sports Facilities Department]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Perry, Pelaez, Trevino  
**Absent:** McKee-Rodriguez

6. **Approval to proceed with scheduling one contract for City Council consideration to provide the San Antonio Public Library with an Annual Contract for Landscaping Services in the estimated total value of \$1,700,000.00 for an initial 3-year term with 2, 1-year options to renew.** [David W. McCary, Assistant City Manager; Ramiro S. Salazar, Director, San Antonio Public Library]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Perry, Pelaez, Trevino  
**Absent:** McKee-Rodriguez

7. **Approval to proceed with scheduling one contract for City Council consideration to provide the San Antonio Public Library with an Annual Contract for Media, Cataloging and Digital Processing Services in the estimated total value of \$15,000,000.00 for an initial 3-year term with 2, 1-year options to renew.** [David W. McCary, Assistant City Manager; Ramiro S. Salazar, Director, San Antonio Public Library]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Perry, Pelaez, Trevino  
**Absent:** McKee-Rodriguez

8. **Approval to proceed with scheduling one contract to provide the Public Works Department with professional asset management services that will provide an automated pavement condition assessment for an estimated total value of \$1,300,000.00 for one year with one, 1-year option to renew.** [Roderick Sanchez, Assistant City Manager; Razi Hosseini, Director, Public Works Department]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Perry, Pelaez, Trevino

**Absent:** McKee-Rodriguez

### **Final Internal Audit Reports**

- 9. Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor report AU21-009 Audit of the Building and Equipment Services Department Light Vehicle Replacement & Maintenance Program**  
[Kevin W. Barthold, City Auditor]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Perry, Pelaez, Trevino  
**Absent:** McKee-Rodriguez

- 10. Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor report AU21-020 Audit of the Parks and Recreation Park Maintenance** [Kevin W. Barthold, City Auditor]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Perry, Pelaez, Trevino  
**Absent:** McKee-Rodriguez

- 11. Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor report AU21-008 Audit of the Aviation Leases Billing and Collections** [Kevin W. Barthold, City Auditor]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Perry, Pelaez, Trevino  
**Absent:** McKee-Rodriguez

- 12. Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor report AU21-037 Audit of the Pre-K 4 SA Grant Program** [Kevin W. Barthold, City Auditor]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Perry, Pelaez, Trevino  
**Absent:** McKee-Rodriguez

- 13. Follow up audit report AU22-F04 Information Technology Services Department Data Loss Prevention** [Kevin W. Barthold, City Auditor]

- If a Committee Member pulls this item off the consent agenda then this item will be briefed in Executive Session pursuant to Texas Government Code Section 551.076, deliberation regarding security devices or security audit.

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Perry, Pelaez, Trevino  
**Absent:** McKee-Rodriguez

## **ITEMS FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION**

### **Pre-Solicitation High Profile Briefings**

- 14. Briefing on the release of a solicitation for one contract to provide the Public Works Department with Master Planning and Architectural Design Services for a new Animal Care Services veterinary hospital in the estimated total value of \$1,250,000.00.** [Roderick Sanchez, Assistant City Manager; Razi Hosseini, Director, Public Works]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Perry, Pelaez, Trevino  
**Absent:** McKee-Rodriguez

Troy Elliott, Deputy Chief Financial Officer, introduced the Item and Public Works Assistant Director Christie Chapman who provided an overview of the Pre-Solicitation of the Master Planning Architecture Design Services for a new Animal Care Services veterinary hospital in the estimated value of \$1,250,000. She reviewed the Request for Proposals (RFP) scope of work, evaluation specifics, timeline of solicitation and services provided under the contract.

## **DISCUSSION**

Chair Perry asked for clarification on the Small Business Economic Development Advocacy (SBEDA) Program requirements on the solicitation. Chapman stated that the SBEDA points were waived but that there was a Small Business subcontracting requirement on the Item.

No action was required for Item 14.

- 15. Briefing on the release of a solicitation to select up to two entities to provide dockless vehicle services for residents. The two-year contracts will include a one-year extension option, and the total estimated revenue for the three year period is \$883,498.50.** [Lori Houston, Assistant City Manager; John Jacks, Director, Center City Development and Operations]

Center City Development and Operations Interim Assistant Director John Stevens provided an overview of the pre-solicitation for dockless vehicle services Request for Proposals (RFP). He reviewed the specifics of the solicitation to include evaluation team, criteria and the timeline for the solicitation. He stated that SBEDA requirements for the solicitation were waived.

## DISCUSSION

Chair Perry asked if this solicitation was similar to the previously awarded contract. Stevens confirmed that the solicitation was the same but would only be for two vendors rather than three. He clarified that there was no cost associated with the contract and that this was a revenue generating contract where the City would receive a portion of the fees per ride. Chair Perry asked why the contract was not for a longer term. Stevens stated that the contract was not for a longer term due to the young nature of the industry and that the industry was volatile. Chair Perry requested that a longer term be considered for the contract. Stevens stated that staff would look into a longer term option.

Citizen Member Trevino asked who considered the total number of vehicles allowed in the contract. Stevens stated that City staff and the vendors agreed upon the total number of vehicles and user demand. He added that the vendors would not be allowed to deploy over the number on the contract.

Councilmember Pelaez asked if there was evidence of how vehicles were being used around bus stops. Stevens stated that data showed that the majority of the vehicles were being used in the downtown area. Councilmember Pelaez expressed concern on the “last mile” scenario of usage but that there were a number of vehicles that were used improperly throughout the City and expressed concern for the true value of the vehicles.

Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez expressed concern on the life span of the vehicle and what was being done to recycle vehicles when they were no longer operable. Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez requested that consideration be made for a recycle plan to be included in the RFP.

Councilmember Pelaez requested data on alternative use of the vehicles and mobility usage of the vehicle and if any true data was available. Stevens stated that there was no specific user data on who was using the vehicles but there were over 900,000 rides recorded in the past year. Councilmember Pelaez stated that he did not support the solicitation.

Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez asked if the user data could be gathered. Stevens stated that the vendors could survey their users and would ask them to report. Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez asked if data was available on actual ridership. Stevens stated that data would be provided after the solicitation process.

Chair Perry thanked staff for the presentation and noted that it was important for the Committee to provide input on the content of the solicitation.

No action was required for Item 15.

- 16. Briefing on the release of a solicitation for funding agreements with known Internet Service Providers (ISPs) or other firms to design, build-out and provide broadband infrastructure/service in underserved communities.** [John Peterek, Assistant to the City Manager; Brian Dillard, Chief Innovation Officer, Office of Innovation]

Councilmember Pelaez moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Perry, Pelaez, Trevino  
**Absent:** McKee-Rodriguez

Innovation Officer Brian Dillard provided an overview on the pre-solicitation for funding agreements for Internet Service Providers (ISPs) for digital divide connectivity for underserved communities. Dillard reviewed the specifics of the Request for Proposals (RFP) to include the evaluation team, evaluation requirements/criteria, SBEDA requirements waiver, and the timeline of the solicitation.

## DISCUSSION

Chair Perry noted that this was a complicated solicitation and that he appreciated the time staff spent on the solicitation. Chair Perry noted that this was a joint solicitation with Bexar County and that Federal funding would be utilized under the contract.

Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez asked for a map of the 25 City locations that would be receiving assistance. Dillard stated that a map would be provided for the City Council to review.

No action was required for Item 16.

## Post-Solicitation High Profile Briefings

- 17. Approval to proceed with scheduling of three contracts for City Council consideration to provide the Animal Care Services Department with Community Spay and Neuter Surgeries in the estimated total value of \$5,900,000.00 for 3 years with 2, 1-year options to renew.** [David W. McCary, Assistant City Manager; Shannon Sims, Director, Animal Care Services]

Animal Care Services Director Shannon Sims provided an overview of the post solicitation for community spay/neuter services and reviewed the specifics of the proposed contract valued at \$5,900,000. Sims noted that three vendors had applied under the solicitation and that all vendors met the requirements of the contract and reviewed the evaluation conducted of the vendors. He stated that staff recommended that all three vendors be awarded the contract.

## DISCUSSION

Chair Perry asked, if additional vendors had applied, would more vendors have been awarded the contract. Simms stated that there was no limit on the number of vendors that could be awarded but only three vendors had applied, and all met qualifications, so staff recommended award to all three.

Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez asked if the inclusion of these vendors would increase the number of spay and neuter surgeries performed. Simms stated that the number would not increase but that other services could be expanded. Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez asked

if these vendors would include mobile unit services. Simms stated that this contract did not include mobile unit services.

Chair Perry asked how many surgeries would be provided on an annual basis. Simms stated that 12,500 services would be provided per year and 62,000 during the life of the contract.

Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez asked for data on how these services had impacted the stray animal population. Simms stated that there was an increase in strays due to COVID and that there was currently a catch up period on those services but he anticipated a decrease in stray populations once services were provided from the vendors.

Chair Perry stated that he was disappointed that more vendors did not apply under the solicitation and asked staff to research ways to increase the number of vendors to include outreach engagement.

Councilmember Trevino moved to Approve. Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Perry, McKee-Rodriguez, Pelaez, Trevino

- 18. Approval to proceed with scheduling six contracts for City Council consideration to provide the Public Works Department with on-call architectural services in the estimated total value of \$15,000,000.00; \$500,000.00 per year, per firm, for an initial 3-year term with two, 1-year options to renew.** [Roderick Sanchez, Assistant City Manager; Razi Hosseini, Director, Public Works Department]

Public Works Assistant Director Christie Chapman provided an overview on the post-solicitation for On-Call architectural services in the estimated value of \$15,000,000 per year, per firm for an initial 3-year term with 2, 1-year options. She reviewed the vendors who had submitted packages and reviewed the evaluation team actions. She stated that staff recommended that six vendors be awarded contracts.

## DISCUSSION

Chair Perry asked for clarification on the number of contracts to be awarded and why more had not been selected. Chapman stated that previous contracts showed that six vendors were regularly used and clarified that these vendors would not be working on bond projects.

Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez moved to Approve. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Perry, McKee-Rodriguez, Pelaez, Trevino

## Staff Briefing

- 19. Briefing by the Office of the City Auditor's Proposed FY2023 Annual Audit Plan** [Kevin W.



Barthold, City Auditor]

City Auditor Kevin Barthold provided an overview of the FY2023 Annual Audit Plan and stated that he had met with the City Council, City departments and staff to determine the Plan. Barthold stated that the Plan included 38 audits but could be modified if needed.

## DISCUSSION

Chair Perry stated that he noticed that the current Plan had less audits than last year. Barthold stated that the FY2022 Plan was very aggressive and that the new Plan was adjusted due to staffing and finalization of previous year plans.

Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez asked for clarification on the housing developer programs to be audited. Barthold stated that the awarded developer contracts would be reviewed to make sure that they were meeting contract specifics. Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez asked how often the pre-mitigation program was reviewed. Barthold stated that audits were conducted usually every five years and had been recently conducted but that he would confirm with staff on the exact date and provide the date to the Committee.

Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez moved to Approve. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Perry, McKee-Rodriguez, Pelaez, Trevino

### **20. Briefing by the Office of the City Auditor's quarterly update of prior audit recommendation status [Kevin W. Barthold, City Auditor]**

City Auditor Kevin Barthold provided a quarterly update of prior audit recommendation statuses and projected completion of those audits.

Chair Perry asked that the report be provided to the entire City Council for review.

No action was required for Item 20.

## **Final Internal Audit Report**

### **21. Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor report AU21-021 Audit of the San Antonio Police Department San Antonio Fear Free Environment (SAFFE) Program [Kevin W. Barthold, City Auditor]**

City Auditor Kevin Barthold provided an overview of the San Antonio Police Department (SAPD) San Antonio Fear Free Environment (SAFEE) Program audit and the findings and recommended corrective actions.

## DISCUSSION

Chair Perry asked Deputy Chief Eric Hightower for specific actions taken from the audit findings. Hightower stated that all items had been addressed immediately or a plan was put in place to correct actions with timelines set on corrective action implementations. Hightower reviewed actions incorporated by staff in addressing audit findings. Chair Perry stated that the services provided by SAFFE were essential to City residents.

Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez stated that Council District 2 residents also supported the services provided by SAFFE Officers but asked if residents were provided data on closed cases. Hightower stated that the audit did identify issues with data being provided to associated case residents and that a process had been developed to address those concerns. Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez asked for clarification on equipment issuance and missing items. Hightower discussed the process in place for tracking of equipment and improved processes.

Citizen Member Trevino stated that case closures not only needed to be focused on but actions should be taken to close the case.

Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez moved to Approve. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Perry, McKee-Rodriguez, Pelaez, Trevino

### **Executive Session**

No Executive Session was held.

### **Consideration of items for future meetings**

### **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 11:48 AM.

**Approved**

---

*Clayton H. Perry, Chair*

*Debbie Racca-Sittre, City Clerk*