

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING  
OF THE MUNICIPAL CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
September 1, 2023 AT 8:30 AM**

The meeting of the Municipal Civil Service Commission was called to order by Joseph Tartell, Chairperson at 8:35 AM.

Those present:

Joseph Tartell, Chairperson  
Brenda Wingert, Commissioner  
Celso Guzman, Commissioner  
Frank Garza, Legal Counsel for the Commission  
Sarah Bilger, Senior Management Coordinator

The Commission proceeded with the hearing of Daniel Mansbach, who filed an appeal to a suspension received from the Development Services Department effective December 12, 2022.

Mr. Mansbach represented himself. The City of San Antonio was represented by Erika Sipiora, Assistant City Attorney. The witnesses were sworn in. The rule was invoked. The hearing was recorded.

The City and Respondent presented their synopsis of what the evidence would show.

CITY'S WITNESSES

1. Roxy Ramirez
2. Johanna Barrera
3. Michael Shannon

CITY'S EXHIBITS

Entire packet submitted

The City rested its case at 9:32 AM.

RESPONDENT'S WITNESSES

1. Deanne Moreno
2. Eddy Garza
3. Jill Lotspeich
4. Derek Urias
5. Daniel Mansbach

RESPONDENT'S EXHIBITS

Exhibits 1-10, secondary set of exhibits not accepted

The Respondent testified and rested its case at 10:45 AM.

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING  
OF THE MUNICIPAL CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
September 1, 2023 AT 8:30 AM**

The Commission went into Executive Session at 11:05 AM and reconvened at 11:35 AM and announced the following:

Commissioner Wingert moved that the evidence and testimony support the violation of Civil Service XVII, subsection (e) and (k) and the disciplinary action should be upheld. Commissioner Guzman seconded the motion. A vote was taken, and the motion passed unanimously. The Commission recommends that the City uphold the suspension.

Minutes presented from June 21, 2023

Commissioner Wingert moved that the minutes be approved as presented, Commissioner Guzman seconded the motion. The motion carried.

Having no other business before the Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 11:37 AM.

---

Joseph Tartell  
Chairperson

---

Brenda Wingert  
Commissioner

---

Celso Guzman  
Commissioner

---

Executive Secretary