

Case Number:	BOA-21-10300158
Applicant:	Joseph Calderoni
Owner:	TX3 Properties LLC
Council District:	1
Location:	615 East Evergreen Street
Legal Description:	Lot 11, Block 27, NCB 399
Zoning:	"R-6 H AHOD" Residential Single-Family Historic Airport Hazard Overlay District
Case Manager:	Rachel Rettaliata, Historic Preservation Specialist, Office of Historic Preservation; Kayla Leal, Principal Planner, DSD

Request

An appeal of the Historic Preservation Officer's (1) denial of the replacement of twenty-two (22) existing, historic wood windows with replacement windows that do not meet the Historic Design Guidelines, Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations, regarding window material and (2) the HDRC stipulations that the applicant salvage and store or re-use existing wood windows on the proposed rear addition and update the fenestration pattern, window opening proportions, and window materials on the proposed rear addition to be consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines and Standard Specifications for Windows in Additions.

Executive Summary

- August 18, 2021 – At the August 18, 2021, Historic and Design Review Commission (HDRC) hearing, the applicant's request was referred to a Design Review Committee (DRC) site visit to review site conditions and to assess the condition of the existing wood windows.
- September 7, 2021 – A Design Review Committee (DRC) site visit was conducted on September 7, 2021, by the DRC and representatives from the Conservation Society of San Antonio and the Office of Historic Preservation. The DRC determined that the existing, historic wood windows were in repairable condition.
- September 15, 2021 – At the September 15, 2021, Historic and Design Review Commission (HDRC) hearing, the applicant's request to replace twenty-two (22) existing, historic wood windows with replacement windows was denied on the basis that the existing wood windows were not deteriorated beyond repair and that the proposed replacement window product, an aluminum-clad material, was not consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines, Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations. Additionally, the applicant's request to construct a 1-story rear addition was approved with HDRC stipulations (i) that the applicant salvages the existing wood windows proposed for removal to accommodate the addition and stores them on site for future use or installs them on the rear addition, and (ii) that the applicant update the fenestration pattern, window opening proportions, and materials so that they are consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines and Standard Specifications for Windows in Additions.

Code Enforcement History

There are no relevant Code Enforcement violations pending.

Permit History

Residential Improvement Permit applications have been submitted for the subject property.

Zoning History

The subject property was located in the Original City Limits of San Antonio and was zoned "D" Apartment District. The zoning changed from "D" to "R-1" Single Family Residence District on December 14, 1995, established by Ordinance 83331. Upon adoption of the 2001 Unified Development Code, established by Ordinance 93881, dated May 3, 2001, the zoning converted from "R-1" to the current "R-6" Residential Single-Family District.

Subject Property Zoning/Land Use

Existing Zoning	Existing Use
"R-6 H AHOD" Residential Single-Family Historic Airport Hazard Overlay District	Single-Family Residence

Surrounding Zoning/Land Use

Orientation	Existing Zoning District(s)	Existing Use
North	"R-6 H AHOD" Residential Single-Family Historic Airport Hazard Overlay District	Single-Family Residence
South	"R-6 H AHOD" Residential Single-Family Historic Airport Hazard Overlay District	Single-Family Residence
East	"R-6 H AHOD" Residential Single-Family Historic Airport Hazard Overlay District	Single-Family Residence
West	"R-6 H AHOD" Residential Single-Family Historic Airport Hazard Overlay District	Single-Family Residence

Comprehensive Plan Consistency/Neighborhood Association

The subject property is located in the Midtown Regional Center Area Plan and is designated "Urban Low Density Residential" in the future land use component of the plan. The subject property is located within the Tobin Hill Neighborhood Association, and they were notified of this application.

Street Classification

East Evergreen Street is classified as a Local Road.

Applicable Citations for Appeal:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- iii. *Windows*—Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

- i. *Historic context*—Design additions to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. Consider character-defining features and details of the original structure in the design of additions. These architectural details include roof form, porches, porticos, cornices, lintels, arches, quoins, chimneys, projecting bays, and the shapes of window and door openings.

Standard Specifications for Windows in Additions and New Construction

- GENERAL: New windows on additions should relate to the windows of the primary historic structure in terms of materiality and overall appearance. Windows used in new construction should be similar in appearance to those commonly found within the district in terms of size, profile, and configuration. While no material is expressly prohibited by the Historic Design Guidelines, a high-quality wood or aluminum-clad wood window product often meets the Guidelines with the stipulations listed below. Whole window systems should match the size of historic windows on property unless otherwise approved.
- SIZE: Windows should feature traditional dimensions and proportions as found within the district.
- SASH: Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25". Stiles must be no wider than 2.25". Top and bottom sashes must be equal in size unless otherwise approved.
- DEPTH: There should be a minimum of 2" in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash.
- This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness.
- TRIM: Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate casing and sloped sill detail. Window track components such as jamb liners must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.
- GLAZING: Windows should feature clear glass. Low-e or reflective coatings are not recommended for replacements. The glazing should not feature faux divided lights with an interior grille. If approved to match a historic window configuration, the window should feature real exterior muntins.
- COLOR: Wood windows should feature a painted finished. If a clad product is approved, white or metallic manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff.
- INSTALLATION: Wood windows should be supplied in a block frame and exclude nailing fins. Window opening sizes should not be altered to accommodate stock sizes prior to approval.
- FINAL APPROVAL: If the proposed window does not meet the aforementioned stipulations, then the applicant must submit updated window specifications to staff for review, prior to purchase and installation. For more assistance, the applicant may request the window supplier to coordinate with staff directly for verification.

Findings:

- a) WINDOW REPLACEMENT – At the September 15, 2021, Historic and Design Review Commission hearing, the applicant’s request to replace twenty-two (22) existing, historic wood windows with replacement windows was denied on the basis that the existing wood windows were not deteriorated beyond repair and that the proposed replacement window product, an aluminum-clad material, was not consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines, Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations.
- b) OHP Staff consistently recommends the repair of existing, historic wood windows, as is recommended by the Historic Design Guidelines, Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations. Historic wood windows were constructed to last 100+ years with old growth wood, which is substantially more durable than modern wood and clad products, and original windows that are restored and maintained over time can last for decades. Replacement window products have a much shorter lifespan, around 10-20 years, and cannot be repaired once they fail. Over 112 million windows end up in landfills each year, and about half are under 20 years old.
- c) The Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations recommends that if original windows are deteriorated beyond repair, they are to be replaced with new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail. The previously proposed replacement windows are not consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines, Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations.
- d) ADDITION – At the September 15, 2021, Historic and Design Review Commission hearing, the applicant’s request to construct a 1-story rear addition was approved with the HDRC stipulations that (i) the applicant salvages the existing wood windows proposed for removal to accommodate the addition and stores them on site for future use or installs them on the rear addition, and that (ii) the applicant update the fenestration pattern, window opening proportions, and materials so that they match the existing window proportions on the primary structure and are consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines and Standard Specifications for Windows in Additions.
- e) OHP staff consistently recommends that historic windows and doors approved for removal to accommodate additions are salvaged and stored on site for future use or re-used in the proposed addition. The proposed rear addition will require the removal of three one-over-one wood windows and one door on the north (rear) elevation. Historic wood windows and doors are valuable materials and are critical in the rehabilitation of historic structures.
- f) The Standard Specifications for Windows in Additions and New Construction recommend that new windows feature traditional dimensions and proportions found within the district. The proposed rear addition includes the installation of one small one-over-one window, a large, fixed window, and a full-lite door on the rear elevation, a large one-over-one window on the east elevation, and a traditional-sized one-over-one window on the west elevation. The proposed fenestration pattern is not consistent with the Standard Specifications for Windows in Additions and New Construction.

OHP Staff Recommendation to the Board of Adjustment

Office of Historic Preservation Staff does not recommend approval of the appeal.

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends that the Board of Adjustment uphold the Historic Preservation Officer’s denial of a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement of existing, historic wood windows with windows that are not consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines, Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations and the approval of HDRC stipulations for (i) the salvaging of historic wood windows removed to accommodate the rear addition and (ii) updated elevation drawings showing windows on the rear addition that match the existing window proportions on the primary structure.