



**CITY OF SAN ANTONIO
OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION**

**HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday, March 1, 2023**

The City of San Antonio Historic and Design Review Commission met on Wednesday, March 1, 2023, at 1901 South Alamo Street, San Antonio, Texas 78204.

MEETING CALLED TO ORDER:

Chairman Fetzer called the meeting to order at 3:00 p.m. for work session.

ROLL CALL:

Present: Gibbs, Fish, Savino, Mazuca, Carpenter, Grube, Cervantes

Absent: Velasquez, Baker, Fetzer, District 4 Commissioner (Vacant)

CHAIRMAN'S STATEMENT:

Vice Chairman Carpenter provided a statement regarding meeting and appeal processes, time limits, and decorum.

ANNOUNCEMENTS:

Spanish interpreter services available to the public during the hearing.

Commissioner Cervantes presented a point of order, to recognize the passing of his grandfather, Monico A. Cervantes, who passed at the age of 101 years old.

OHP staff invited the public to an event on Saturday, March 4th, a continuation of the African American storytelling supporting the cultural context statement at the Carver Library.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Item 4 – Lisa Lynde on behalf of the King William Association Architectural Advisory Committee provided comments.

Item 4 – King William Association Architectural Advisory Committee submitted a letter in opposition to the case.

Item 7 – Teresa Ybanez, a member of Mission San Jose Neighborhood Association supported the case.

Item 7 – Mission San Jose Neighborhood Association submitted a letter in support of the case.

Commissioner Carpenter asked if any commissioner would like to pull items from the consent agenda.

Commissioner Savino requested Item 4 to be pulled from the consent agenda to individual consideration.

CONSENT AGENDA:

Item 1, Case No. 2023-035	101 NEWELL
Item 2, Case No. 2023-063	145 NAVARRO ST
Item 3, Case No. 2023-065	510 S ALAMO ST
Item 5, Case No. 2023-058	505 E PARK AVE
Item 6, Case No. 2022-386	302 LAMAR ST
Item 7, Case No. 2023-049	3214 MISSION RD
Item 8, Case No. 2023-033	13102 JONES MALTSBERGER RD

MOTION: Commissioner Fish moved to approve items 1-3 and 5-8 with staff stipulations.
Commissioner Cervantes seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Gibbs, Fish, Savino, Mazuca, Grube, Cervantes, Carpenter,
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Velasquez, Baker, Fetzer, District 4 Commissioner (Vacant)

ACTION: The MOTION PASSED with 7 AYES. 0 NAYS. 4 ABSENT.

INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION ITEMS:

ITEM 4. HDRC NO. 2023-066
ADDRESS: 218 WASHINGTON ST
APPLICANT: Anne Toxey

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Install a cupola on the roof of the rear accessory structure featuring clerestory windows.
2. Install a dormer on the central volume of the west elevation of the rear accessory structure.
3. Install a white standing seam metal roof.
4. Replace the existing metal rolling garage doors with insulated glass garage doors.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Items 1-4, staff recommends approval based on findings a through f with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant installs fully wood windows based on findings c and d, or windows that closely mimic the appearance of wood windows. The applicant is required to submit final material specifications to staff prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness showing that the windows feature an inset of two (2) inches within facades and should feature profiles that are found historically within the immediate vicinity. If operable, meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25" (when applicable) and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening. Faux divided lites are not permitted.
- ii. That the applicant submits final material specifications for the cupola and dormer cladding to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness based on findings c and d.
- iii. That the applicant installs a standing seam metal hip roof featuring panels that are 18 to 21 inches wide, seams that are 1 to 2 inches high, a crimped ridge seam, and a white finish. Panels should be smooth without striation or corrugation. Ridges are to feature a double-munch or crimped ridge configuration; no vented ridge caps or end caps are allowed based on finding e. All chimney, flue, and related existing roof details must be preserved. An onsite inspection must be scheduled with OHP staff prior to the start of work to verify that the roofing material matches the approved specifications.
- iv. That the applicant submits final material specifications for the replacement garage doors to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness based on finding f.

PUBLIC COMMENT: Provided at the beginning of the meeting.

MAIN MOTION:

Commissioner Savino moved to approve items 1, 2, and 4, and the added stipulation on item 3 that the roof is not white in color.

Commissioner Cervantes seconded the motion.

AMENDMENT TO MOTION:

Commissioner Fish moved to amend the motion to approve item 3 as submitted by the applicant.

Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

VOTE ON AMENDMENT:

AYE: Gibbs, Fish, Mazuca, Grube, Cervantes

NAY: Savino, Carpenter

ABSENT: Velasquez, Baker, Fetzer, District 4 Commissioner (Vacant)

ACTION: AMENDMENT PASSED with 5 AYES. 2 NAYS. 4 ABSENT.

AMENDED MAIN MOTION VOTE: AYE: Gibbs, Fish, Savino, Mazuca, Grube, Cervantes, Carpenter
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Velasquez, Baker, Fetzer, District 4 Commissioner (Vacant)

ACTION: AMENDED MOTION PASSED with 7 AYES. 0 NAYS. 4 ABSENT.

ITEM 9. HDRC NO. 2023-042
ADDRESS: 211 W SHERIDAN
APPLICANT: Lilian Otterbach/SPESEN MANAGEMENT LLC

REQUEST:

The applicant requests approval to:

1. Remove all wood window screens.
2. Obtain Historic Tax Certification for the property 211 W Sheridan.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval of item 1, based on finding d. Staff recommends the applicant repair the existing historic wood window screens with in-kind material.

Non-original, metal window screens can be removed. Staff recommends wood screens that match the original in profile, material and appearance be installed as replacements for non-original screens.

Staff recommends approval of item 2, based on findings e and f.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

MOTION: Commissioner Grube moved to approve items 1 and 2 with the stipulation to retain any remaining screens on the property.
Commissioner Cervantes seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Gibbs, Fish, Savino, Mazuca, Grube, Cervantes, Carpenter
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Velasquez, Baker, Fetzer, District 4 Commissioner (Vacant)

ACTION: MOTION PASSED with 7 AYES. 0 NAYS. 4 ABSENT.

ITEM 10. HDRC NO. 2023-051
ADDRESS: 732 LAMAR ST
APPLICANT: Loren Drum/Texas Home Check Engineers

REQUEST:

The applicant requests a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Replace 22 wood windows with new wood windows of the same size.
2. Replace five existing doors.
3. Replace the front porch decking.
4. Replace existing 6' wood privacy fence in kind.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Item 1: Staff recommends approval of replacement of windows numbered 1-5, 12-19, and 22 on the attached site plan, based on finding c, with the following stipulations:

- i. That all documented historic window conditions be returned.

Staff does not recommend approval of the replacement of windows numbered 6-11, 20, and 21 on the attached site plan, based on finding c. Staff recommends these wood windows be retained and repaired.

Item 2: Staff recommends approval to replace one modern door on the south elevation based on finding g, with the follow stipulation:

- i. That the applicant submits materials specifications for the replacement product to staff prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Staff does not recommend replacement of the three 15-lite and one half-lite wood doors, based on finding g. Staff recommends repair and retention of these four doors.

Item 3: Staff recommends approval of replacement of the front porch decking based on finding h, with the following stipulation:

- i. That the applicant installs the wood decking perpendicular to the façade.

Item 4: Staff recommends approval of in-kind replacement of the 6' wood privacy fence, based on finding i, with the following stipulations:

- i. That nonconforming and unapproved work is brought into compliance prior to issues of a Certificate of Appropriateness that includes this scope of work.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Lulu Francois on behalf of the Concerned Citizens of Dignowity Hill provided comments.

MOTION: Commissioner Cervantes moved for a continuance to the next available Historic and Design Review Commission meeting
Commissioner Savino seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Gibbs, Fish, Savino, Mazuca, Grube, Cervantes, Carpenter
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Velasquez, Baker, Fetzer, District 4 Commissioner (Vacant)

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 7 AYES. 0 NAYS. 4 ABSENT.**

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 3:44 p.m.

APPROVED

Jeffrey Fetzer, Chair
Historic Design Review Commission
City of San Antonio

Date: _____