



CITY OF SAN ANTONIO
OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION

HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES
February 15, 2023

The City of San Antonio Historic and Design Review Commission met on Wednesday, February 15, 2023, at 1901 South Alamo Street, San Antonio, Texas 78204.

MEETING CALLED TO ORDER:

Chairman Fetzer called the meeting to order at 3:06 p.m. for work session.

ROLL CALL:

Present: Savino, Carpenter, Grube, Cervantes, Baker, Fetzer

Absent: Gibbs, Fish, Velasquez, Mazuca, District 4 Commissioner (Vacant)

CHAIRMAN'S STATEMENT:

Chairman Fetzer provided a statement regarding meeting and appeal processes, time limits and decorum.

ANNOUNCEMENTS:

Spanish interpreter services available to the public during the hearing.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Item 1 – Kathy Krnavik, on behalf of the Conservation Society of San Antonio, opposed the case.

Item 1 – The Conservation Society of San Antonio submitted a letter and voicemail in opposition to the case.

Item 2 – Concerned Citizens of Dignowity Hill provided comments.

Item 10 – Monticello Park Neighborhood Association supported the case.

Chairman Fetzer asked if any commissioner would like to pull items from the consent agenda.

Commissioner Cervantes requested Item 1 be pulled from the consent agenda for individual consideration.

Chairman Fetzer recused for Item 3. Item 3 continued to the next agenda due to a lack of quorum.

Commissioner Savino requested Item 13 be pulled from the consent agenda for individual consideration.

CONSENT AGENDA:

Item 2, Case No. 2023-040	918 DAWSON ST
Item 4, Case No. 2023-034	116 CAMARGO
Item 5, Case No. 2022-533	802 N PINE ST
Item 6, Case No. 2023-041	224 E CAROLINA ST
Item 7, Case No. 2023-055	3244 MISSION RD
Item 8, Case No. 2023-054	311 EAGLELAND DR
Item 9, Case No. 2023-056	237 CLAUDIA ST
Item 10, Case No. 2023-057	1946 W Gramercy
Item 11, Case No. 2023-050	228 BARRERA
Item 12, Case No. 2023-059	331 W ELSMERE PLACE

MOTION: Commissioner Carpenter moved to approve items 2, 4 – 12 with staff stipulations.
Commissioner Savino seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Savino, Carpenter, Grube, Cervantes, Baker, Fetzer
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Gibbs, Fish, Velasquez, Mazuca, District 4 Commissioner (Vacant)

ACTION: The MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES. 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT.

INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION ITEMS:

ITEM 1. HDRC NO. 2023-038
ADDRESS: 202 N ST MARYS ST, 130 N ST MARYS ST
APPLICANT: Anthony Byron

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a hotel tower to feature seventeen stories, not including the river level, to feature an overall height of approximately 203 feet. The proposed hotel received final approval in May 2019 but has since been amended regarding height.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through u with the following stipulations:

- i. That any curb cut on N St Mary's be limited in width to no more than twenty-five (25) feet in width and should not result in a change of grade at the pedestrian level as to not interrupt pedestrian traffic on N St Mary's.
- ii. ARCHAEOLOGY – An archaeological investigation is required. The project shall comply with all federal, state, and local laws, rules, and regulations regarding archaeology, as applicable.

PUBLIC COMMENT: Provided at the beginning of the meeting.

MOTION: Commissioner Grube moved to approve with staff stipulations.
Commissioner Carpenter seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Carpenter, Grube, Baker, Fetzer
NAY: Savino, Cervantes
ABSENT: Gibbs, Fish, Velasquez, Mazuca, District 4 Commissioner (Vacant)

ACTION: MOTION PASSED with 4 AYES. 2 NAYS. 5 ABSENT.

ITEM 13. HDRC NO. 2023-037
ADDRESS: 304 SADIE ST
APPLICANT: Henry Tijerina/Tijerina Construction LLC

REQUEST:

The applicant requests a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Relocate one historic wood window on the west elevation of the house.
2. Install a dormer on the north side of the house with a single-pane wood hopper window.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval of items 1 and 2 based on findings b and c, with the following stipulation:

- i. That the relocated window be ganged with the neighboring window on the west elevation to include a wood mullion and continuous sill.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

1ST MOTION: Commissioner Carpenter moved to approve with staff stipulations.
Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.
Commissioner Savino added an amendment to the motion: retain the dormer with a hipped roof rather than a gable roof dormer.
Commissioner Cervantes seconded the amended motion.

VOTE: AYE: Savino, Cervantes
NAY: Carpenter, Grube, Baker, Fetzer
ABSENT: Gibbs, Fish, Velasquez, Mazuca, District 4 Commissioner (Vacant)

ACTION: MOTION FAILED with 2 AYES. 4 NAYS. 5 ABSENT.

2nd MOTION: Commissioner Carpenter moved to approve with staff stipulations.
Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Savino, Carpenter, Grube, Cervantes, Baker, Fetzer
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Gibbs, Fish, Velasquez, Mazuca, District 4 Commissioner (Vacant)

ACTION: MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES. 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT.

ITEM 14. HDRC NO. 2023-039
ADDRESS: 918 N PINE ST
APPLICANT: David Ericsson

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Construct a steel carport structure to feature an overall length of 74' – 0", an overall depth of approximately 20' – 0", and an overall height of 8' – 7".
2. Construct a CMU wall parallel to N Pine Street to screen the proposed parking from view from the right of way.
3. Install a landscaping garden to screen both the CMU wall and steel carport from view from the right of way.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

1. Staff does not recommend approval of item #1, the construction of a steel carport structure based on finding c. Staff recommends the applicant proposed a carport with a location and materials consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction.
2. Staff does not recommend approval of item #2, the construction of an exposed, CMU wall parallel to the front property line and right of way, based on finding d. Staff recommends the applicant proposed fencing that is consistent with the Guidelines and historic examples found within the district.
3. Staff recommends approval of item #3, the installation of a landscape garden to feature native grasses based on finding e with the stipulation that a detailed landscaping plan be submitted for review and approval that should be consistent with the Guidelines and adopted policy documents.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Scott Albert provided comments.

Valerie Cortez, on behalf of the Concerned Citizens of Dignowity Hill provided comments.

MOTION: Commissioner Savino moved to conceptually approve with the stipulation that the applicant attend the Design Review Committee with an amended design.
Commissioner Carpenter seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Savino, Carpenter, Grube, Cervantes, Baker, Fetzer
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Gibbs, Fish, Velasquez, Mazuca, District 4 Commissioner (Vacant)

ACTION: MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES. 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT.

ITEM 15. HDRC NO. 2023-060
ADDRESS: 410 AUSTIN ST
APPLICANT: Lydell Toye/U.S.Signs

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install a reverse-lit, channel letter sign on the front façade of the historic building at 410 Austin.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends the applicant submit an amended sign design and location. Staff recommends a vertically oriented blade sign to be located to the far left or right of the front façade.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

MOTION: Commissioner Grube moved to approve as presented by the applicant.
Commissioner Baker seconded the motion.

AMENDMENTS:

1. Commissioner Savino motioned for an amendment to include a backer panel with the intention to avoid penetration in the brick. Commissioner Cervantes seconded the amendment.

AMENDMENT VOTE: AYE: Savino, Carpenter, Grube, Cervantes, Baker, Fetzer
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Gibbs, Fish, Velasquez, Mazuca, District 4 Commissioner (Vacant)

ACTION: AMMENDED MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES. 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT.

MAIN MOTION VOTE: AYE: Savino, Carpenter, Grube, Cervantes, Baker, Fetzer
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Gibbs, Fish, Velasquez, Mazuca, District 4 Commissioner (Vacant)

ACTION: MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES. 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT.

ITEM 16. HDRC NO. 2023-053
ADDRESS: 922 HAYS ST
APPLICANT: Michael & Kelsey Shaffer

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Install composite siding with a faux wood grain finish on the rear addition.
2. Receive Historic Tax Verification.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Item 1, staff does not recommend approval of the installation of faux wood grain composite siding on the rear addition. The applicant is required to install composite siding with a smooth finish and an exposure of 4 inches to comply with the HDRC stipulation for Case No. 2019-182.

Item 2, staff does not recommend Historic Tax Verification at this time based on finding c. The property will be eligible for the Substantial Rehabilitation Tax Incentive once the property comes into compliance.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Valerie Cortez, on behalf of the Concerned Citizens of Dignowity Hill, opposed the tax verification.

MOTION: Commissioner Carpenter moved to approve as submitted by the applicant.
Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Carpenter, Grube, Cervantes, Baker, Fetzer

NAY: Savino
ABSENT: Gibbs, Fish, Velasquez, Mazuca, District 4 Commissioner (Vacant)

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 5 AYES. 1 NAY. 5 ABSENT.**

ITEM 17. **HDRC NO. 2023-043**
ADDRESS: 501 QUITMAN ST
APPLICANT: Melody Patrick/FDN Home, LLC DBA Forty Degrees North

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to: install a standing seam metal roof with striations.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval of the standing seam metal roof with striations. Staff recommends that the applicant installs a standing seam metal roof featuring panels that are 18 to 21 inches wide, seams that are 1 to 2 inches high, a crimped ridge seam, and a standard galvalume finish. Panels should be smooth without striation or corrugation. Ridges are to feature a double-munch or crimped ridge configuration; no vented ridge caps or end caps are allowed. An on-site inspection must be scheduled with OHP staff prior to the start of work to verify that the roofing material matches the approved specifications. All chimney, flue, and related existing roof details must be preserved.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Marlene Hawkins opposed the case.

MOTION: Commissioner Grube moved to deny the application.
Commissioner Carpenter seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Savino, Carpenter, Grube, Cervantes, Fetzner
NAY: Baker
ABSENT: Gibbs, Fish, Velasquez, Mazuca, District 4 Commissioner (Vacant)

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 5 AYES. 1 NAY. 5 ABSENT.**

ITEM 18. **HDRC NO. 2023-052**
ADDRESS: 225 LINDELL PLACE
APPLICANT: Jonathan Reynolds/Reyven Contracting

REQUEST:

The applicant requests a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Construct a one-story approx. 560-square-foot rear addition that includes 221 square feet of living space, a 262-square-foot screened-in porch, and a 76-square-foot open porch.
2. Construct an 87.5-square-foot addition to the north side of the house.
3. Replace four wood windows with salvaged wood window systems.
4. Replace two one-over-one wood windows on the south elevation with a fixed square window and a fixed clerestory window.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval of items 1 and 2, construction of rear and north additions, based on findings a through h, with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant proposes a roof form that creates a smooth transition between the proposed gabled roof form and the shed roof.

- ii. That the applicant use cement board siding with the same exposure as found on the historic core of the house and utilize a trim piece to differentiate between old and new.
- iii. That the applicant propose a one-over-one window or a pair of one-over-one windows in place of the proposed fixed windows on the rear addition.

Staff does not recommend approval of item 3, replacing four wood windows with salvaged wood window systems, based on finding i. Staff recommends the existing wood windows be retained and repaired.

Staff does not recommend approval of item 4, replacing two one-over-one wood windows on the south elevation with a fixed square window and a fixed clerestory window, based on finding j.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Barbara Witte-Howell, Chair of the River Road Neighborhood Association Historic Resources Committee, provided comments.

MOTION: Commissioner Grube moved to refer to the Design Review Committee.
Commissioner Carpenter seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Savino, Carpenter, Grube, Cervantes, Baker, Fetzer
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Gibbs, Fish, Velasquez, Mazuca, District 4 Commissioner (Vacant)

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES. 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT.**

ITEM 19. HDRC NO. 2023-024
ADDRESS: 423 E DEWEY PLACE
APPLICANT: William Wheeler/Stonewall Property Group

REQUEST:

The applicant requests approval to paint the exterior of a single-family house, an apartment building, and utility building. Exterior materials are predominately rock veneer.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval of the request to paint the unpainted stone veneer based on finding c.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

MOTION: Commissioner Carpenter moved to deny the application.
Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Savino, Carpenter, Grube, Cervantes, Baker, Fetzer
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Gibbs, Fish, Velasquez, Mazuca, District 4 Commissioner (Vacant)

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES. 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT.**

ITEM 20. HDRC NO. 2023-048
ADDRESS: 322 N HACKBERRY ST
APPLICANT: Noe Noe Garcia/N/A

REQUEST:

The applicant requests approval to replace all exterior wood siding with D105 wood siding.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval of the replacement of original wood siding with profile 105 siding, based on finding d. Staff recommends the applicant match the original profile.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Valerie Cortez, on behalf of the Concerned Citizens of Dignowity Hill, agreed with staff recommendations.

MOTION: Commissioner Savino moved to approve with staff stipulations including the retention of all remaining siding and gable shake.
Commissioner Cervantes seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Savino, Carpenter, Grube, Cervantes, Baker, Fetzer
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Gibbs, Fish, Velasquez, Mazuca, District 4 Commissioner (Vacant)

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES. 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT.**

ITEM 21. HDRC NO. 2023-036
ADDRESS: 453 CLUB DR
APPLICANT: Linda Smith/SMITH LINDA LOU TRUST

REQUEST:

The applicant requests approval to install a metal security door with perforated metal screen in front of the existing front door.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval of the request to install the screen door, based on finding b. Staff recommends the applicant install a wood screen door with a fabric mesh that is mostly transparent.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Montejano supported the case.

Cretia Rodriguez supported the case.

Thomas Scott supported the case.

Bianca Maldonado, on behalf of the Monticello Park Neighborhood Association, opposed the case.

Kim Bishop supported the case.

Cretia Rodriguez supported the case.

Carolyn Thomas supported the case.

MOTION: Commissioner Cervantes moved to approve with the stipulation that it is nonintrusive to design, color, and installation and can be easily removed.
Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Savino, Carpenter, Grube, Cervantes, Baker, Fetzer
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Gibbs, Fish, Velasquez, Mazuca, District 4 Commissioner (Vacant)

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES. 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT.**

ITEM 22. HDRC NO. 2023-045
ADDRESS: 922 NOLAN ST
APPLICANT: Drew Warwick/JB Woolf Shed's

REQUEST:

The applicant requests a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a 12'x20'x9' shed on a slab foundation.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval. The applicant has not submitted the required documentation necessary for review and approval by the HDRC. If the HDRC feels compelled to take action based on the documentation provided, staff recommends that the proposed siding and windows be updated to be more consistent with the Guidelines and that the applicant submit accurate measured drawings and a site plan to illustrate the proposed scope of work.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Valerie Cortez, on behalf of the Concerned Citizens of Dignowity Hill, opposed the case.

MOTION: Commissioner Carpenter moved to conceptually approve with staff stipulations and confirmation of the driveway remaining within guidelines.
Commissioner Savino seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Savino, Carpenter, Grube, Cervantes, Baker, Fetzer
NAY: None.
ABSENT: Gibbs, Fish, Velasquez, Mazuca, District 4 Commissioner (Vacant)

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES. 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT.**

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 8:27 p.m.

APPROVED

Jeffrey Fetzer, Chair
Historic Design Review Commission
City of San Antonio

Date: _____