

# HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

June 01, 2022

**HDRC CASE NO:** 2022-309  
**ADDRESS:** 501 QUITMAN ST  
**LEGAL DESCRIPTION:** NCB 992 BLK 1 LOT S 120 FT OF MID 40 FT OF B  
**ZONING:** R-6, H  
**CITY COUNCIL DIST.:** 2  
**DISTRICT:** Government Hill Historic District  
**APPLICANT:** Melody Patrick/FDN Home, LLC DBA Forty Degrees North  
**OWNER:** BEXAR TEXAS REAL PROPERTY TRUST TWO  
**TYPE OF WORK:** Construction of a rear addition, rehabilitation, repair and maintenance, roof replacement  
**APPLICATION RECEIVED:** May 13, 2022  
**60-DAY REVIEW:** Not applicable due to City Council Emergency Orders  
**CASE MANAGER:** Edward Hall

## REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Repair siding and trim and paint the exterior of the historic structure.
2. Repair the porch ceiling, wrought iron columns.
3. Repair the foundation and repair the existing, wood skirting.
4. Replace the existing, standing seam metal roof with a new, standing seam metal roof.
5. Repair all existing wood windows.
6. Remove one, modified window opening on the east façade.
7. Construct a rear addition to feature approximately 400 square feet.

## APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

*Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations*

### 1. Materials: Woodwork

#### B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

*i. Façade materials*—Avoid removing materials that are in good condition or that can be repaired in place. Consider exposing original wood siding if it is currently covered with vinyl or aluminum siding, stucco, or other materials that have not achieved historic significance.

*ii. Materials*—Use in-kind materials when possible or materials similar in size, scale, and character when exterior woodwork is beyond repair. Ensure replacement siding is installed to match the original pattern, including exposures. Do not introduce modern materials that can accelerate and hide deterioration of historic materials. Hardiboard and other cementitious materials are not recommended.

*iii. Replacement elements*—Replace wood elements in-kind as a replacement for existing wood siding, matching in profile, dimensions, material, and finish, when beyond repair.

### 3. Materials: Roofs

#### A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

*i. Regular maintenance and cleaning*—Avoid the build-up of accumulated dirt and retained moisture. This can lead to the growth of moss and other vegetation, which can lead to roof damage. Check roof surface for breaks or holes and flashing for open seams and repair as needed.

#### B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

*i. Roof replacement*—Consider roof replacement when more than 25-30 percent of the roof area is damaged or 25-30 percent of the roof tiles (slate, clay tile, or cement) or shingles are missing or damaged.

- ii. Roof form*—Preserve the original shape, line, pitch, and overhang of historic roofs when replacement is necessary.
- iii. Roof features*—Preserve and repair distinctive roof features such as cornices, parapets, dormers, open eaves with exposed rafters and decorative or plain rafter tails, flared eaves or decorative purlins, and brackets with shaped ends.
- iv. Materials: sloped roofs*—Replace roofing materials in-kind whenever possible when the roof must be replaced. Retain and re-use historic materials when large-scale replacement of roof materials other than asphalt shingles is required (e.g., slate or clay tiles). Salvaged materials should be re-used on roof forms that are most visible from the public right-of-way. Match new roofing materials to the original materials in terms of their scale, color, texture, profile, and style, or select materials consistent with the building style, when in-kind replacement is not possible.
- v. Materials: flat roofs*—Allow use of contemporary roofing materials on flat or gently sloping roofs not visible from the public right-of-way.
- vi. Materials: metal roofs*—Use metal roofs on structures that historically had a metal roof or where a metal roof is appropriate for the style or construction period. Refer to Checklist for Metal Roofs on page 10 for desired metal roof specifications when considering a new metal roof. New metal roofs that adhere to these guidelines can be approved administratively as long as documentation can be provided that shows that the home has historically had a metal roof.
- vii. Roof vents*—Maintain existing historic roof vents. When deteriorated beyond repair, replace roof vents in-kind or with one similar in design and material to those historically used when in-kind replacement is not possible.

## 6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

### A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. Openings*—Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right of-way.
- ii. Doors*—Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.
- iii. Windows*—Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.

### B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.
- ii. New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.
- iii. Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows.
- iv. Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.
- v. Muntins*—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.

## *Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 3, Guidelines for Additions*

### 1. Massing and Form of Residential Additions

#### A. GENERAL

- i. Minimize visual impact*—Site residential additions at the side or rear of the building whenever possible to minimize views of the addition from the public right-of-way. An addition to the front of a building would be inappropriate.
- ii. Historic context*—Design new residential additions to be in keeping with the existing, historic context of the block. For example, a large, two-story addition on a block comprised of single-story homes would not be appropriate.
- iii. Similar roof form*—Utilize a similar roof pitch, form, overhang, and orientation as the historic structure for additions.
- iv. Transitions between old and new*—Utilize a setback or recessed area and a small change in detailing at the seam of the historic structure and new addition to provide a clear visual distinction between old and new building forms.

## B. SCALE, MASSING, AND FORM

- i. Subordinate to principal facade—Design residential additions, including porches and balconies, to be subordinate to the principal facade of the original structure in terms of their scale and mass.
- ii. Rooftop additions—Limit rooftop additions to rear facades to preserve the historic scale and form of the building from the street level and minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. Full-floor second story additions that obscure the form of the original structure are not appropriate.
- iii. Dormers—Ensure dormers are compatible in size, scale, proportion, placement, and detail with the style of the house. Locate dormers only on non-primary facades (those not facing the public right-of-way) if not historically found within the district.
- iv. Footprint—The building footprint should respond to the size of the lot. An appropriate yard to building ratio should be maintained for consistency within historic districts. Residential additions should not be so large as to double the existing building footprint, regardless of lot size.
- v. Height—Generally, the height of new additions should be consistent with the height of the existing structure. The maximum height of new additions should be determined by examining the line-of-sight or visibility from the street. Addition height should never be so contrasting as to overwhelm or distract from the existing structure.

## 3. Materials and Textures

### A. COMPLEMENTARY MATERIALS

- i. Complementary materials—Use materials that match in type, color, and texture and include an offset or reveal to distinguish the addition from the historic structure whenever possible. Any new materials introduced to the site as a result of an addition must be compatible with the architectural style and materials of the original structure.
- ii. Metal roofs—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alternations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.
- iii. Other roofing materials—Match original roofs in terms of form and materials. For example, when adding on to a building with a clay tile roof, the addition should have a roof that is clay tile, synthetic clay tile, or a material that appears similar in color and dimension to the existing clay tile.

### B. INAPPROPRIATE MATERIALS

- i. Imitation or synthetic materials—Do not use imitation or synthetic materials, such as vinyl siding, brick or simulated stone veneer, plastic, or other materials not compatible with the architectural style and materials of the original structure.

### C. REUSE OF HISTORIC MATERIALS

- i. Salvage—Salvage and reuse historic materials, where possible, that will be covered or removed as a result of an addition.

## 4. Architectural Details

### A. GENERAL

- i. Historic context—Design additions to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. Consider character-defining features and details of the original structure in the design of additions. These architectural details include roof form, porches, porticos, cornices, lintels, arches, quoins, chimneys, projecting bays, and the shapes of window and door openings.
- ii. Architectural details—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the architectural style of the original structure. Details should be simple in design and compliment the character of the original structure. Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found on the original structure should not be used to avoid drawing undue attention to the addition.
- iii. Contemporary interpretations—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for additions. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the addition is new.

### *Standard Specifications for Windows in Additions and New Construction*

Consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines, the following recommendations are made for windows to be used in new construction:

- **GENERAL:** Windows used in new construction should be similar in appearance to those commonly found within the district in terms of size, profile, and configuration. While no material is expressly prohibited by the Historic Design Guidelines, a high quality wood or aluminum-clad wood window product often meets the Guidelines with the stipulations listed below.
- **SIZE:** Windows should feature traditional dimensions and proportions as found within the district.
- **SASH:** Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25". Stiles must be no wider than 2.25". Top and bottom sashes must be equal in size unless otherwise approved.
- **DEPTH:** There should be a minimum of 2" in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. All windows should be supplied in a block frame and exclude nailing fins which limit the ability to sufficiently recess the windows.
- **TRIM:** Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate casing and sloped sill detail.
- **GLAZING:** Windows should feature clear glass. Low-e or reflective coatings are not recommended for replacements. The glazing should not feature faux divided lights with an interior grille. If approved to match a historic window configuration, the window should feature true, exterior muntins.
- **COLOR:** Wood windows should feature a painted finish. If a clad or non-wood product is approved, white or metallic manufacturer's color is not allowed and color selection must be presented to staff.

## **FINDINGS:**

- a. The historic structure at 501 Quitman was constructed circa 1920 and is first found on the 1922 Sanborn Map. The structure was constructed in the Craftsman style and is contributing to the Government Hill Historic District.
- b. **EXISTING LOT** – The existing lot features an existing rear addition, a side metal carport, and a non-contributing rear accessory structure. Neither of these structures are found on the 1951 Sanborn Map. Staff finds them to be non-contributing and their removal to be appropriate.
- c. **SIDING/TRIM REPAIR AND PAINTING** – The applicant has proposed to repair the existing siding and trim in-kind and the paint the historic structure. Staff finds the proposed scopes of work to be appropriate and consistent with the Guidelines.
- d. **PORCH REPAIR** – The applicant has proposed to repair the existing, beadboard porch ceiling and to paint the existing, wrought iron columns. The applicant has noted that the porch ceiling will be repaired, in-kind. Staff finds the proposed scope of work to be appropriate; however, staff finds that the existing, concrete porch should remain unpainted.
- e. **FOUNDATION REPAIR** – The applicant has proposed to repair the historic structure's foundation and foundation skirting. The applicant has noted the repair of the foundation skirting, in-kind, to match the 117 profile siding of the historic structure. Staff finds this to be appropriate and consistent with the Guidelines.
- f. **ROOF REPLACEMENT** – The applicant has proposed to replace the existing, standing seam metal roof with a new standing seam metal roof. The applicant has noted that the proposed roof will feature panels that are 18 to 21 inches wide, seams that are 1 to 2 inches in height, a standard galvalume finish and a low profile ridge cap. Staff finds the applicant's proposal to be consistent with the Guidelines; however, the applicant should submit a detail of the proposed ridge cap to OHP staff for review and approval. All roofing panels should be smooth with no striations or corrugation. The existing chimney should be preserved and maintained in its entirety.
- g. **WINDOW REPAIR** – The applicant has proposed to repair fourteen (14) wood windows in place. Five (5) existing wood windows that are in an existing addition and on the rear façade of the historic structure will be repaired and reused within the proposed addition. Staff finds the proposed window repair to be appropriate and consistent with the Guidelines.
- h. **FENESTRATION MODIFICATION** – The applicant has proposed to remove one, non-original window opening on the east façade. The current opening is not original in size or profile and features a non-original aluminum window. Staff finds that a complete restoration of the window opening would be most appropriate; however, staff finds the applicant request to be appropriate given the current state of the opening and the window installed.
- i. **REAR ADDITION** – The applicant has proposed to construct a rear addition to feature approximately 400 square feet. The rear addition will be in the location of an existing addition as well as a non-contributing rear accessory structure. The proposed rear addition will feature a small, attached porch at its rear.
- j. **REAR ADDITION** – The Guidelines for Additions 1.A. notes that additions should be sited to minimize view from the public right of way, should be designed to be in keeping with the existing, historic context of the

block, should feature similar roof forms, and should feature a transition to differentiate the new addition from the historic structure. Additionally, the Guidelines for Additions 1.B notes that additions should be subordinate to the principal façade of the historic structure, should feature a footprint that responds to the size of the lot, should not double the existing building footprint, and should feature an overall height that is generally consistent with that of the historic structure. Generally, staff finds the proposed addition to be appropriate and consistent with the Guidelines; however, staff finds that a vertical trim piece should be added to the west elevation to differentiate the addition from the primary historic structure.

- k. MATERIALS – The applicant has proposed for the rear addition to feature wood siding and trim to match the original. Additionally, the applicant has proposed for the rear addition to feature Craftsman style wood doors and salvaged wood windows. Staff finds the proposed additions to be appropriate and consistent with the Guidelines.
- l. ROOF FORM – The applicant has proposed for the rear addition to feature a gabled roof. The proposed roof form is appropriate and consistent with the Guidelines and Craftsman style of the historic structure.
- m. ARCHITECTURAL DETAILS – Generally, staff finds the architectural elements, massing and materials of the proposed addition to be appropriate and consistent with the Guidelines.

## **RECOMMENDATION:**

- 1. - 6. Staff recommends approval of items #1 through #5 based on findings c through g with the following stipulations:
  - i. That the existing, concrete porch remain unpainted, as noted in finding d.
  - ii. That the roof feature panels that are 18 to 21 inches wide, seams that are 1 to 2 inches in height, a crimped ridge seam and a standard galvalume finish. Panels should be smooth and not feature corrugation or striations. A ridge cap with no end cap or a ridge sleeve should be submitted to OHP staff for review and approval.
  
- 7. Staff recommend approval of items #7, the construction of a rear addition based on findings i through m with the following stipulations:
  - i. That a vertical trim piece be installed on the west façade to differentiate the addition from the primary historic structure.