

HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

February 16, 2022

HDRC CASE NO: 2022-089
ADDRESS: 2419 MCCULLOUGH AVE
LEGAL DESCRIPTION: NCB 1706 BLK 2 LOT 11, 12 AND 13
ZONING: MF-33 IDZ, H
CITY COUNCIL DIST.: 1
DISTRICT: Monte Vista Historic District
APPLICANT: Michael Flynn
OWNER: KEYSTONE SCHOOL
TYPE OF WORK: Front yard fence installation
APPLICATION RECEIVED: January 26, 2022
60-DAY REVIEW: Not applicable due to City Council Emergency Orders
CASE MANAGER: Claudia Espinosa

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the existing, temporary chain link fence with a 6-foot wrought iron fence. The proposed fencing will be located in both the front and side yards, parallel to McCullough Avenue and E Woodlawn.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

2. Fences and Walls

A. HISTORIC FENCES AND WALLS

- i. *Preserve*—Retain historic fences and walls.
- ii. *Repair and replacement*—Replace only deteriorated sections that are beyond repair. Match replacement materials (including mortar) to the color, texture, size, profile, and finish of the original.
- iii. *Application of paint and cementitious coatings*—Do not paint historic masonry walls or cover them with stone facing or stucco or other cementitious coatings.

B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS

- i. *Design*—New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure.
- ii. *Location*—Avoid installing a fence or wall in a location where one did not historically exist, particularly within the front yard. The appropriateness of a front yard fence or wall is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences or wall should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them.
- iii. *Height*—Limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. The appropriateness of a front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. If a taller fence or wall existed historically, additional height may be considered. The height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.

iv. *Prohibited materials*—Do not use exposed concrete masonry units (CMU), Keystone or similar interlocking retaining wall systems, concrete block, vinyl fencing, or chain link fencing.

v. *Appropriate materials*—Construct new fences or walls of materials similar to fence materials historically used in the district. Select materials that are similar in scale, texture, color, and form as those historically used in the district, and that are compatible with the main structure. Screening incompatible uses—Review alternative fence heights and materials for appropriateness where residential properties are adjacent to commercial or other potentially incompatible uses.

C. PRIVACY FENCES AND WALLS

i. *Relationship to front facade*—Set privacy fences back from the front façade of the building, rather than aligning them with the front façade of the structure to reduce their visual prominence.

ii. *Location* – Do not use privacy fences in front yards.

FINDINGS:

a. The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the existing, chain link fence with a wrought iron fence. The proposed fencing will be located in both the front and side yards, parallel to McCullough Avenue and E Woodlawn.

b. FENCE DESIGN – The applicant has proposed to install a wrought iron fence within both the front and side yards to feature six (6) feet in height. Per the Guidelines for Site Elements B. i. new fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure. Generally, staff finds the proposed location and design of the fence to be appropriate and consistent with the Guidelines.

c. FENCE HEIGHT – Per the Guidelines for Site Elements 2.B.iii., applicants should limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. As proposed, the fence is to feature six (6) feet in height. Staff finds that within the front yard, the proposed fencing should not exceed four (4) feet in height to be consistent with the Guidelines. Staff finds that fencing at six (6) feet in height is appropriate in the side yard, parallel to E Woodlawn.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through d with the following stipulation:

i. That the proposed front yard fencing, parallel to McCullough and east of the existing, sloped driveway approach feature a height that does not exceed four (4) feet in height.

ii. That fencing at six (6) feet in height only be installed parallel to E Woodlawn, west of the existing, sloped driveway approach.

E Woodlawn Ave

E Woodlawn Ave

Travis Tile Design Center

2419 McCullough
San Antonio, TX 7

Keystone School

E Craig Pl

E Craig Pl

E Craig Pl

McCullough

2414 McCullough Ave

San Antonio, Texas

Google

Street View - Feb 2021

12 foot tall removable netting system

6 foot tall permanent metal fencing

VOTE YES FOR
TRANSIT
Help San Antonio Moving

RICHHOFF
SHERIFF

MIDTOWN

Google



Groceries

Restaurants

Takeout

Hotels

Gas

Pharmacies

Coffee

m Ave E Woodlawn Ave

m Ave E Woodlawn Ave



40' x 70'
Concrete pad

McCullough Ave

McCullough Ave

McCullough Ave



Google

124

2419



12 foot tall - 1 3/4" multi sport mesh netting to encompass concrete pad

6 foot tall metal fencing to replace perimeter chain link fencing



Google

