

City of San Antonio



Minutes

Audit Committee

2023 – 2025 Council Members

Chair: Phyllis Viagran, District 3

John Courage, District 9 | Marc Whyte, District 10

Citizen Representative Dr. Judy Trevino and Philip M. Harris

Monday, December 16, 2024

10:00 AM

Council Briefing Room

The Audit Committee convened a regular meeting in the City Hall Council Briefing Room beginning at 10:04 AM. Deputy City Clerk Aurora Perkins took the Roll Call noting a quorum with the following Committee Members present:

Members Present: Phyllis Viagran, *Chair*
John Courage, *Member*
Philip Harris, *Citizen Member*

Members Absent: Marc Whyte, *Member*
Dr. Judy Trevino, *Citizen Member*

Approval of Minutes

1. Approval of minutes from the November 12, 2024 Audit Committee Meeting

Councilmember Courage moved to Approve the minutes of the November 12, 2024 Audit Committee meeting. Citizen Member Harris seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Harris

Absent: Whyte, Trevino

Public Comments

None.

CONSENT AGENDA

Final Internal Audit Reports

2. Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor Report AU24-001 Audit of Aviation Landing Fees [Baltazar Vargas, City Auditor]

Councilmember Courage moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Citizen Member Harris seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Harris
Absent: Whyte, Trevino

3. Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor Report AU24-006 Audit of CSF Alamodome Concessions Contract [Baltazar Vargas, City Auditor]

Councilmember Courage moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Citizen Member Harris seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Harris
Absent: Whyte, Trevino

ITEMS FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

Pre-Solicitation High Profile Briefings

4. Briefing on the release of a solicitation for up to four contracts to provide the Public Works Department with On-Call Transportation Systems Management and Operation (TSMO) Engineering Services to support traffic signal and Intelligent Transportation Systems (ITS) design and operational improvement efforts in the estimated total value of \$20,000,000 for a 3-year term, with 2, 1-year options to renew. [John Peterek, Interim Assistant City Manager; Razi Hosseini, Director, Public Works Department]

Luis Maltos, Assistant Director for Public Works, provided an overview of the pre-solicitation for the Public Works Request for Qualifications (RFQ) for up to four firms to provide on-call engineering services to provide traffic engineering analysis and design services which included, but were not limited to, traffic signal design, traffic signal re-timing, engineering analysis, and construction phase services. Maltos noted that the proposed term was for three years with two, one-year options with an estimated total value of \$20 million. He added that funding sources were from Federal Transportation Funding.

Maltos reviewed the NIGP Codes to be utilized in the contract and spoke to the composition of the evaluation committee, evaluation criteria and additional requirements of responding vendors. He noted that the solicitation would be released on December 19, 2024, and would remain open until February 11, 2025. Maltos stated that the evaluation committee would review responsive bids on March 11, 2025, and the anticipated City Council consideration date would be in May 2025.

DISCUSSION

Chair Viagran noted her interest on transportation associated solicitations and asked if the solicitation would address traffic lighting and calming issues. Maltos confirmed that the consultants hired on this solicitation would address traffic calming and lighting issues and that Transportation

and Operations Program Manager Marc Jacobson would be the City's main point of contact. Chair Viagran reiterated the importance of local knowledge of traffic patterns and that the consultants be sensitive to local concerns.

Councilmember Courage noted resident concerns of traffic lighting synchronization and addressing light duration and asked if the consultants would address those concerns. Maltos confirmed that the hired vendors would address those types of concerns and issues.

Councilmember Courage asked if lighting timing when no opposing traffic was occurring would be synchronized. Maltos confirmed that expanding timing technology would be done under this solicitation. Councilmember Courage requested data on where this technology was already in place.

The item was for briefing purposes only.

Post-Solicitation High Profile Briefings

- 5. Approval to proceed with scheduling two contracts for City Council consideration to provide the Public Works Department with On-Call Environmental Remediation and Disposal Services related to federal transportation projects, capital improvement bond projects, and other City projects, located citywide in the estimated total value of \$7,500,000 for an initial contract term of 3 years with 2, 1-year options to renew.** [John Peterek, Interim Assistant City Manager; Razi Hosseini, Director, Public Works Department]

Luis Maltos, Public Works Assistant Director, provided an overview of the Request for Proposals for On-Call Environmental Remediation and Disposal Services for bond and City-funded projects citywide. He stated that the proposed term for the solicitation was for three years with two, one-year options. He added that the current contract expired on September 9, 2024.

Maltos noted that there were three vendors that submitted on this solicitation but two were being recommended for the award. He stated that 89 vendors were contacted and he spoke to the due diligence conducted with no material findings found.

DISCUSSION

Chair Viagran asked if there was more use being seen for these services. Maltos stated that 75% of projects needed this type of service where old facilities were being removed and checked for contaminants. He added that soil boring was done to ensure that no contaminants were found where lines were being installed such as utility or drainage piping.

Chair Viagran noted that in the southern sector, there were many old pipes with asbestos being found. She asked what would happen if the capacity under the contract was met quickly. Maltos stated that the contract could return to the City Council to approve additional funding.

Councilmember Courage asked how hazardous materials found were removed. Maltos stated that hazardous material disposal depended on what was found and requirements were followed based on the materials to State and Federal standards. Maltos stressed that correct protocols were always followed and certified.

Councilmember Courage moved to Approve. Citizen Member Harris seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Harris

Absent: Whyte, Trevino

6. **Approval to proceed with scheduling one contract for City Council consideration to provide the Public Works Department with a contractor for the construction of the West College Link (St. Mary's University to Memorial High School to Zarzamora Creek) project located in Council Districts 5 and 7 in the estimated total value of \$5,253,869.** [John Peterek, Interim Assistant City Manager; Razi Hosseini, Director, Public Works]

Public Works Assistant Director Luis Maltos presented an overview of the Public Works Request for Competitive Sealed Proposals (RFCSP) for the construction of West College Link (St. Mary's University to Memorial High School to Zarzamora Creek) which was a 2022 Bond Program Project located in Council Districts 5 and 7. He noted that the proposed term was for 360 calendar days with an estimated total value of \$5.2 million.

Maltos reviewed the project scope which included the building of a shared-use path, new pedestrian lighting, street and mill overlay, utility upgrades, and the Silva Cell Tree Root System. He noted that Public Works worked closely with the Parks and Recreation Department on this project due to the tree system component.

Maltos stated that the evaluation committee had met on November 18, 2024, and by consensus, recommended an award to the sole responsive bidder. He noted that notification of the solicitation had gone out to 546 vendors and that there was only one responsive bidder.

DISCUSSION

Chair Viagran noted her support of the project.

Councilmember Courage asked for clarification on trail path dimensions and whether it would be able to accommodate bikes and walker traffic. Maltos stated that the shared-use path would be 12 feet wide and would accommodate walker and bike traffic. Councilmember Courage asked if the path could have been made wider. Maltos stated that the path could not be made wider due to ROW limitations but that he was confident that it would meet the need. Councilmember Courage requested an analysis of the usage of the path to determine if 12 feet was sufficient.

Final Internal Audit Report

7. **Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor Report AU23-033 Audit of Public Safety 9-1-1 Operations** [Baltazar Vargas, City Auditor]

Audit Manager Mark Bigler provided an overview of the Final Audit of the 9-1-1 Public Safety Operations. He stated that the objective of the audit was to determine if 9-1-1 operations were effective, efficient, and complied with national standards. Bigler noted that the audit found that both the San Antonio Fire Department (SAFD) and the San Antonio Police Department (SAPD) operations met all the National Emergency Number Association (NENA) standards for call

answering times.

Bigler noted that an initial audit was performed in 2016 and the standards were for 90% of calls to be answered within 10 seconds of the call being received. He stated that the initial audit found that 58% of SAPD 9-1-1 calls were being answered in less than 10 seconds and that SAFD calls were at 63%. He stated that in this audit it was found that SAPD had a 95% answer rate and the SAFD answer rate had increased to 89%.

Bigler reviewed the minor findings of the audit which included consistencies of a final review of all calls, addressing staffing levels, Quality Assurance Program compliance, and Operations Continuity Procedures compliance. He stated that staff was provided recommendations and they were implemented by SAFD and SAPD.

Bigler reviewed audit findings associated with Joint SAPD/SAFD/ITSD operations which identified that call center staff may have not been consistently calling back calls that were abandoned by the caller, which were calls placed to 9-1-1 in which the caller disconnected before the call could be answered by the 9-1-1 call center. He noted that badge access logs were not being performed consistently and the Computer Aided Dispatch (CAD) user access was not sufficiently restricted.

According to Bigler, SAPD, SAFD, and ITSD management agreed with the audit findings and developed positive action plans to address issues with an anticipated completion in March 2025.

DISCUSSION

Chief Financial Officer Ben Gorzell noted that a management response was prepared by SAPD and SAFD and asked each Chief to provide the report.

Police Chief William McManus spoke to the implementation of call review metrics and quality assurance standards that had been added to staff employee performance evaluations (EPE) and rated as such in order to make sure that call standards were being met. He noted that a process had been implemented where management would review the call back process and metrics on a quarterly basis to make sure that they were being met. He added that coaching and training would be provided as needed.

McManus reviewed steps taken to determine call back numbers and processes to determine caller information for the call back process. He also noted steps taken to meet the badge access review process.

Fire Chief Valerie Frausto reviewed the implemented process for review of the communication division and compliance of standards to SAPD and ITSD. She noted that SAFD would further evaluate changes to shift standards to ensure addressing staff stress factors.

Frausto stated that leadership would also implement evaluations of call takers on call data, abandoned calls, and badge access.

Councilmember Courage noted that the first pages of the audit stated that SAPD and SAFD were not evaluating and documenting all the calls that came in. He expressed his concern of the non-

completion of documentation and noted that standards needed to be improved for overall safety and true evaluation of standards being met. On the topic of abandoned call, he stressed that follow-up for abandoned calls was needed and followed. SAPD Assistant Director Rick Riley stressed that quality assurance was a priority for the public safety team and noted observations of a low number of evaluations and that a strong push was made to increase evaluations and address weak points of quality assurance. He noted that evaluation results would be reported back to call takers at evaluation time and periodically during the year. Riley clarified that the abandoned call process increased time to three seconds rather than one second to capture phone numbers so that more calls would be returned.

Councilmember Courage thanked staff for their efforts to increase call tracking and evaluations and stressed the importance of call-taking and public safety.

Chair Viagran noted that critical events often had several callers making calls to 9-1-1 and asked if there was a way to track multi-caller events in relation to abandoned calls. She expressed her concern of CAD user access challenges and stated that it needed to be continuously evaluated. Councilmember Viagran asked that community education be provided on calling 9-1-1 on critical events where there may be many calling in to report incidents.

Councilmember Courage moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Citizen Member Harris seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Harris

Absent: Whyte, Trevino

Consideration of items for future meetings

Next Scheduled Meeting Date: January 14, 2025

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 10:49 a.m.

Approved

Phyllis Viagran, Chair

*Debbie Racca-Sittre
City Clerk*