

City of San Antonio



Minutes

Community Health Committee

2023 – 2025 Council Members

Chair: Teri Castillo, Dist. 5

Dr. Sukh Kaur, Dist. 1 | Phyllis Viagran, Dist. 3

Dr. Adriana Rocha Garcia, Dist. 4 | Marina Alderete Gavito, Dist. 7

Friday, November 22, 2024

1:00 PM

City Hall

The Community Health Committee convened a regular meeting in the City Hall Council Briefing Room beginning at 1:03 PM. Deputy City Clerk Aurora Perkins took the Roll Call noting a quorum with the following Committee Members present:

Members Present: Teri Castillo, *Chair*
Dr. Sukh Kaur, *Member*
Phyllis Viagran, *Member*
Dr. Adriana Rocha Garcia, *Member*

Members Absent: Marina Alderete Gavito, *Member*

Approval of Minutes

1. Approval of minutes from the Community Health Committee meeting on August 22, 2024.

Councilmember Kaur moved to Approve the minutes of the August 22, 2024 Community Health Committee meeting. Councilmember Viagran seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Castillo, Kaur, Viagran, Rocha Garcia

Absent: Alderete Gavito

Public Comments

There was no Public Comment.

Briefing and Possible Action on

2. Briefing and possible action on updates to the City of San Antonio's Non-Discrimination Ordinance (NDO). [Dr. Jennifer Mata, Director, Diversity, Equity, Inclusion & Accessibility Department]

Dr Jennifer Mata, Director of Diversity, Equity, Inclusion and Accessibility Office (DEIA) introduced the Item and Civil Rights Manager Samantha Smith who provided an update to the City of San Antonio's Non-Discrimination Ordinance (NDO). She stated that the NDO was first approved in September 2013 and updated in October 2021. Smith noted that the DEIA had changed in make-up and now included the Office of the Civil Rights Manager, Disability Access Office, Language Access Office, the Office of Equity, and the Immigrant Affairs Office. She provided a brief of the NDO review and noted that staff last presented to the Community Health Committee in March 2023.

Smith stated that the NDO jurisdiction prohibited discrimination in the appointments of board/commissions officials, City of San Antonio employment, public accommodations, housing and required all City contractors to comply with the NDO policy.

Smith noted that the NDO section protected categories included race, color, religion, national origin, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, veteran status, age, and disability. She reviewed what DEIA was seeking to update in the NDO which included terms of gender identity, sex, sexual orientation, veteran status, and disability. She added that DEIA sought to add new definitions to include gender expression, religious entity, and protective hairstyles which was expanded under the State's Crown Act.

Smith stated that the new NDO sought to update roles and definitions to include those of DEIA; the Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) removal of repetitive language and other clarifications; and Neighborhood Housing Services Department (NHSD) provisions for fair housing and the complaint process.

Smith noted that the proposed NDO added accountability measures under several categories to include under EEO to extend protection to include discharge or other adverse impact, requiring objectivity in investigations and uses of inclusive languages. She reviewed public accommodation expanded measures to be updated to include DEIA named as the responsible department and updates to various processes. Smith noted that under housing there would be provisions for expanded enforcement, statutes of limitations deadline updates, and clarification of the complaint process. She added that a mandatory review of the NDO by the City Council would be performed every five (5) years.

Smith reviewed community input meetings conducted which included consultations from community organizations that had been identified by City Councilmembers. She noted that input was provided on various subjects of EEO which included protective hairstyle definitions, disability terms, EEO provisions, sex/sexual orientation/gender terminology, and expression terminology.

Smith spoke to new provisions in the NDO that included the development of a Non-Discrimination Plan which provided comprehensive tracking and reporting of any complaints related to NDO, Title VI, and accessibility which would be consistent across all City departments. She noted that this would be a multi-phase process over the course of several months so to ensure an equitable, inclusive, and accessible San Antonio.

DISCUSSION

Chair Castillo thanked staff for their briefing and of the CCR that was submitted by Councilmember McKee-Rodriguez that brought diversity and equity updates to light. She spoke to the organizations which had been consulted in the review of the NDO and supported the proposed changes, especially in those related to NHSD and equitable housing.

Councilmember Kaur asked for clarification on the amount of time that it would take to develop the comprehensive plan. Smith stated that the plan would be developed from the beginning and would work with all departments to include input and to develop a strong program. Councilmember Kaur challenged DEIA to develop a plan and timeline to possibly build the plan within six months.

Councilmember Kaur asked if DEIA had set guidelines for titles on staff email signatures for identification pronouns (he/him, she/her/, they/them). Smith stated that DEIA allowed for staff to use identification pronouns but did not regulate the requirement for identification pronouns signature and would defer to the Human Resources Department for requirement clarification. Councilmember Kaur supported the updates but reiterated the need for a quicker timeline for implementation.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia inquired about how complaints were tracked currently. Smith stated that the current process was a manual process via excel spreadsheets, but that staff was looking to acquire a system that would enable them to pull better reports and data.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia asked what other cities were looked at to compare NDO programs. Smith stated that staff reviewed programs from seven other Texas cities to include Austin, Dallas, Houston, El Paso, Corpus Christi, Ft Worth, and Arlington.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia asked for clarification on NHSD NDO mediation policies and guidelines that were being reviewed. Smith stated that currently, staff worked with HUD standards for mediation which needed to be updated and clarified statutes of limitations in the NDO.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia asked if there was a consistent process to file complaints within all departments. Smith clarified that currently there was not a set process throughout all departments and that DEIA would develop a unified process which could be utilized through the DEIA website. Councilmember Rocha Garcia stressed that objectivity was crucial and asked how objectivity would be obtained. Smith stated that staff was responsible for the development of the processes when reviewing policies and developing a City-wide policy. Smith noted the staff responsible for the review to include EEO Administrator Scott Russell.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia asked how updates to the NDO would be communicated to all City departments. Smith stated that DEIA staff was currently developing the communication plan to provide information to all departments. Assistant City Manager David McCary added that communications would also be provided at Department Head meetings and opportunities for input at that level.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia asked how the same standards would be applied to contractors. Smith clarified that all City contracts contained the NDO provision. Councilmember Rocha Garcia

asked if the proposed changes would be highlighted in procurement solicitations. First City Attorney Liz Provencio stated that the NDO update would be worked into the procurement processes with the Procurement Division for best clarification as would be done for any updates in any areas.

Councilmember Viagran asked for clarification on religious entity definitions. Smith stated that there needed to be clarification on what defined a religious entity wholly. Councilmember Viagran asked if this would include agnostic and atheist classifications. Smith stated that religion would not be defined but to be clarified for non-discrimination. Councilmember Viagran noted that Catholic Charities could not discriminate under City contracts. Provencio stated that on a case-by-case basis contracts would be reviewed on whether religious freedoms were violated but that all cases would be reviewed if a complaint was filed.

Councilmember Viagran stated that she felt there were some City departments with cultures of discrimination and asked how they would be tracked/corrected. Provencio clarified that EEO and NDO processes would be followed in complaint cases and what policy would take precedence in cases of employee or outside complaints.

Councilmember Viagran stated that she supported changes but noted that much work was still needed.

Chair Castillo stated that she supported the identified quickened timeline for plan development.

No action was taken on the Item.

3. Briefing on Shade as Art – Art as Shade. [Lori Houston, Assistant City Manager; Krystal Jones, Director, Department of Arts & Culture]

Krystal Jones, Arts and Culture Director, provided an overview of the Shade as Art – Art as Shade strategy presented by Council Consideration Request (CCR) -2023-0026 which was authored by Councilmember Pelaez. She stated that the CCR was brought forward due to San Antonio's extreme heat which has increased the desire for shade structures installed in and along neighborhoods, commercial corridors, public spaces, and pedestrian right-of-way while there was also an increased desire for public art in these same spaces. Jones noted that the CCR requested a City-wide strategy to integrate shade in public art into shade into art structure and include public input and advice from artists, designers, and art organizations on the strategy.

Jones presented existing artistic shade structures in the City of San Antonio in various council districts. She noted that there were currently 15 structures in the community and noted that many of the structures had multiple uses.

Jones reviewed best practices research and stated that many cities were seeking to combat urban heat islands through municipal public art and architect-led projects. She noted that shade structures were both temporary and permanent structures that could be funded through capital improvement projects with some grant opportunities. She added that there was consideration for American with Disability Act (ADA) accessibility and traffic protection components.

Jones noted that the Arts and Culture Department (ACD) had worked closely with Public Works and the Office of Sustainability to develop a GIS map for heat vulnerability locations. She spoke to research findings that identified target areas with high heat vulnerability and fewer existing public art projects. Jones stated that staff looked at targeted neighborhoods with Cool Neighborhood Programs in Council Districts 2, 3, and 5.

Jones stated that there was a three-prong strategy to the program which included the first strategy to work collaboratively with other COSA departments and outside partners to include VIA Metropolitan Transit, American for the Arts Public Art Network, and the Urban Arts Coalition.

Jones reviewed strategy #2 which was to identify opportunities to include artistic shade in capital improvement projects to include the 2022 Bond Projects. She noted that the Culebra Road Bond Project had identified opportunities for Art as Shade components, and she spoke to five identified opportunities within various council districts that were great options for shade structures. Jones stated that the developed map would provide information for future bond programs.

Jones spoke to Strategy #3 which sought to find funding sources outside of capital projects which would result in shade as art/art as shade options. She noted that grant opportunities existed with the National Endowment for the Arts Project Grant Program, Bloomberg Philanthropies Grant Program, and under the Resiliency, Energy, Efficiency, and Sustainability (REES) Fund. According to Jones, \$1 million had been identified by VIA for bus shade structures which the City was collaborating to identify bus stop sites.

Jones reviewed the next steps for the program which included continuing cross-departmental and partner agency collaboration, project initiation for existing 2022 Bond Projects, identifying additional 2022 Bond Project candidate sites, selecting bus stop candidates for shade, and researching and identifying grant opportunities.

DISCUSSION

Chair Castillo supported cross-departmental collaboration and heat index reference for project identification. She thanked Councilmember Pelaez for the CCR he submitted to address this issue and noted that the Wall Street Journal article that highlighted Guadalupe St shade structures as a positive use example of shade as art/art as shade.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia asked if along with shade if cooling components could be considered. Jones stated that all options were being considered with artists including water collection and cooling options but noted that the only limitation was the Budget. She stressed that cross-collaboration was key.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia asked if natural shading was being included in the program. Jones confirmed that staff worked closely with the Parks and Recreation Department to review natural components of landscape to include in the design of projects.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia noted that the heat map presented showed many shade structures in the downtown and north part of the City and asked that staff work with VIA to identify other shade options within other parts of the City. She stated that it was important to discuss the movement of

current bus stops to more naturally shaded areas.

Councilmember Kaur asked for consideration for shade at the Arneson River Theater. Jones stated that staff would work with CCDO for options to be incorporated into the project into capital improvements. She noted that Council District 1 had identified some shade options at McArthur Park and requested that other shade ideas be test-cased to determine how much they would cost to develop shade components and incorporate them into the next bond program.

Councilmember Viagran asked for clarification on where artists or other partners could find components of the shade program to participate.

Councilmember Viagran asked if digital art components were being included in the shade structures and other identified projects. She requested more conversation on possible revenue streams from digital art and spoke to possible options on Military Drive and Presa Street.

No action was taken on the Item.

4. Briefing on the Creative Industry Economic Impact. [Krystal Jones, Director, Department of Arts & Culture]

Jones provided an overview of the economic impacts of San Antonio's creative industry and noted that the arts had a strong economic impact on the City. She introduced Dr. Steve Niven who reviewed methodology, the definition of creative industry, economic impacts, and found conclusions. Jones encouraged the Committee to become familiar with reports speaking to the impacts of art nationally.

Niven spoke to the methodology of San Antonio industry impacts which included geography, employment, income levels, economic conversion factors, and multiplier effects in relation to exports of art.

Niven reviewed the definition of NAICS Codes under the creative industry and spoke to the direct employment in San Antonio by year since 2019. He noted that there was a decrease in employment during the COVID-19 Pandemic but that the creative industry had grown significantly in the overall recovery years. He reviewed income levels and economic impacts of artists and art-related industries which had shown recovery since 2019. According to Niven, the income of the creative industry in San Antonio was over \$1.1 billion and the direct annual output of creative industry was over \$4.5 billion in 2023.

Niven noted that the total economic impact of the creative industry employed over 24,000 individuals with labor income totaling over \$1.3 billion and output of products over \$5.9 billion in 2023. He spoke to art pieces that had been completed by San Antonio artists.

Niven reviewed export data by year and noted that it had recovered since the COVID-19 Pandemic and totaled over \$740 billion in 2023. He noted that the percentage of demand met by imports was 69% in 2022 and 67% in 2023 which was an opportunity for import replacement. Niven reviewed data associated with direct employment, direct labor income, and direct economic impact.

Niven stated in conclusion that the creative industry made a substantial contribution to the San Antonio economy, but its impacts extended well beyond the standard economic impacts of an industry. He added that the art industry not only added economic impact but also had cultural, creative expression, and communal impacts.

DISCUSSION

Chair Castillo thanked the team for the presentation and noted the impact of art to the community and all residents who don't have to be artists to appreciate and, in many ways, can create safety when they also provide light to spaces. She stressed that inviting spaces supported businesses in the area.

Councilmember Viagran asked if it would be helpful for the Committee to appoint a subcommittee in economic development to identify workforce or cost impacts under the arts. Jones stated that this could be brought to the Arts Commission and other Art associated committees for input on challenges or impacts to the industry. Councilmember Viagran stated that she would like the input to be brought back to the Community Health Committee before taking it to the Economic and Workforce Development Committee for other possible initiatives.

Councilmember Kaur asked if there were other ways to perform an analysis other than income data for economic input since there could be artists who did not report income in traditional manners. Niven stated that the data methods were universally used Federally in relation to self-employment for over 20 years. He stated that he was confident of the data method using multiplier effects. Councilmember Kaur requested input from the Arts Commission on the data presented and to ask what other areas of the industry should be supported more.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia noted the impact of the industry and the challenges it faced. She asked for clarification on exports data impact and if there were particular variables that could pinpoint export data increases. Niven stated that the general economic trends showed growth and bounce back from the COVID-19 Pandemic and the spending of individuals with recovered income.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia asked how much funding was budgeted for creative arts. Jones noted that \$7 million in grant funding was budgeted with an overall Budget of over \$15 million.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia asked what services were provided to artists on opportunities. Jones stated that there was a large number of staff working with individual artists who were considered small businesses and educating them on business opportunities locally and nationally. Councilmember Rocha Garcia supported the efforts of staff and other community non-profit partners. She requested consideration of programs for youth education of art entrepreneurial opportunities. Jones spoke to current efforts with partners to educate all artists for entrepreneurial opportunities including the development of art statements, grant opportunities, and marketing.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia stressed the importance of marketing artists and spoke to coursework she conducted as a university professor and that of PreK4SA marketing of student art. Jones noted the importance of collaboration and education of the artists' community and spoke to the artist directory developed by ACD and directing organizations to the directory for resources for educational opportunities for students.

Councilmember Rocha Garcia requested consideration of the return of artist highlights within the community as was done in the past. Jones noted that the previous initiative was coordinated by the Parks and Recreation Department but that staff would look for collaboration opportunities with other City departments.

Chair Castillo spoke to local artist spotlights at a convention she attended in St. Louis and asked staff to look into opportunities for artist to sell their art at local conventions.

No action was taken on the Item.

Consent Agenda

Adjournment

There being no further discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 3:43 p.m.

APPROVED

Teri Castillo, Chair

*Debbie Racca-Sittre
City Clerk*