

City of San Antonio



Minutes

Audit Committee

2023 – 2025 Council Members

Chair: Phyllis Viagran, District 3

John Courage, District 9 | Marc Whyte, District 10

Citizen Representative Dr. Judy Trevino and Philip M. Harris

Tuesday, November 12, 2024

10:00 AM

Council Briefing Room

The Audit Committee convened a regular meeting in the City Hall Council Briefing Room beginning at 10:01 AM. City Clerk Debbie Racca-Sittre took the Roll Call noting a quorum with the following Committee Members present:

Members Present: Phyllis Viagran, *Chair*
John Courage, *Member*
Marc Whyte, *Member*
Philip Harris, *Citizen Member*

Members Absent: Dr. Judy Trevino, *Citizen Member*

Approval of Minutes

1. Approval of minutes from the October 8, 2024 Audit Committee Meeting

Citizen Member Harris moved to Approve the minutes of the October 8, 2024 Audit Committee meeting. Councilmember Whyte seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Whyte, Harris
Absent: Courage, Trevino

Public Comments

There was no Public Comment.

CONSENT AGENDA

Final Internal Audit Reports

2. Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor Report AU24-035 Audit of Public Works Communication and Outreach [Kevin W. Barthold, City Auditor].

Councilmember Whyte had questions on the audit, therefore, he pulled the Item from the Consent Agenda for discussion. Councilmember Whyte urged the Audit Team to interview affected businesses. Abigail Estevez, Audit Manager for the project stated that they attended community meetings but did not interview the impacted business owners. Councilmember Whyte asked why the reporting systems were not included within the scope of this audit. Estevez stated that they looked at some 3-1-1 tickets but did not audit access controls as that was planned as a part of the audit of the Customer Service 3-1-1 department. Councilmember Whyte expressed concern with inconsistent reporting through the 3-1-1 system and asked for the difference between short-term and long-term projects. Estevez stated that a short-term project was for less than one year. Councilmember Whyte did not feel that there had been adequate communication with stakeholders on those short-term projects in his council district.

Chair Viagran thanked Councilmember Whyte for bringing this issue forward and thanked the Audit Team for their work, however, she noted that there was a discrepancy as to what was adequate communication so she suggested sending communication concerns to PCDC or to a B Session regarding Public Works communications related to projects.

Councilmember Courage agreed that better comprehensive growth planning was needed, not just for Public Works projects such as streets, sidewalks, and drainage but for other projects including utilities and private projects.

Chair Viagran suggested that a subcommittee of the Audit Committee be formed to help with this issue. Councilmember Whyte added that the communication between Public Works and SAWS needed improvement.

Citizen Member Harris moved to Approve. Councilmember Viagran seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Harris
Absent: Trevino

ITEMS FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

Pre-Solicitation High Profile Briefings

- 3. Briefing on the release of a solicitation for one contract to provide the Development Services Department with biological services in support of the Southern Edwards Plateau Habitat Conservation Plan in the estimated total value of \$2,040,000 for a 1-year term with 5, 1-year options to renew.** [John Peterek, Interim Assistant City Manager; Amin Tohmaz, PE, CBO, Interim Director, Development Services Department]

Interim Assistant Director of the Development Services Department (DSD) Logan Sparrow provided the pre-solicitation briefing for a Request for Proposals (RFP) which was expected to be issued on November 18, 2024, and awarded in April 2025. Sparrow listed the proposed evaluation panelists, described outreach and notification methods, and outlined scoring criteria which included 35 points for experience, 30 points for the plan, 10 points for pricing, 5 points for Small Business Enterprise (SBE), 5 points for Minority/Women Business Enterprise (M/WBE),

10 points for the Local Preference Program (LPP), and 5 points for the Veterans Preference Program.

Sparrow stated that DSD was seeking a U.S. Fish and Wildlife (USFW) certified biologist and/or environmental company with experience in implementing Habitat Conservation Plans to support the operation, administration, management, and coordination of the Southern Edwards Plateau - Habitat Conservation Plan (SEP-HCP). He noted that the USFW Service issued a joint 30-year incidental take permit between the City of San Antonio and Bexar County. Sparrow added that Bexar County was awarded a previous contract which would expire on February 28, 2025, and the City of San Antonio and DSD planned to take over the contract as agreed with Bexar County.

DISCUSSION:

Councilmember Courage asked if the Program was to preserve endangered species on conservation preserve areas acquired through the Edwards Aquifer Protection Program (EAPP). Sparrow explained that the contract would include maintenance and monitoring of those preserves as well as review of other sensitive areas.

Chair Viagran noted that the Item was for briefing only so no action was taken.

- 4. Briefing on the release of a solicitation for one contract to provide the Department of Human Services with Meal Preparation Services for the City's Healthy Eating, Aging and Living (HEAL) nutrition program, in the estimated total value of \$17,129,146 for a 1-year term, with a 4, 1-year renewal options.** [Lori Houston, Assistant City Manager; Melody Woosley, Director, Department of Human Services]

Assistant Director of the Department of Human Services (DHS) Jessica Dovalina stated that the HEAL Program served hot lunches to approximately 2,000 older adults daily at 44 sites which included community centers, churches, and City-owned and operated facilities located within Bexar County. Dovalina stated that the current contract was set to expire on September 30, 2024.

Dovalina listed the proposed evaluation panelists, described outreach and notification methods, and outlined scoring criteria which included 40 points for experience, 40 points for the plan, and 20 points for pricing. She stated that the Small Business Economic Development Advocacy Program (SBEDA) and both the Local Preference Program, and the Veterans Preference Program were not applicable.

Councilmember Whyte asked why this was a one-year contract with four renewals. Deputy Chief Financial Officer Troy Elliott stated that the target was a five-year contract, but this gave the department flexibility to change directions if they were not happy with the services or if funding was terminated. Dovalina clarified that the AACOG funding was awarded annually even though it had been received for the past 30 years.

Councilmember Courage clarified that the Federal Funds came through the State of Texas to AACOG. Dovalina stated that \$2.1 million were Federal Funds and the rest was from the City of San Antonio General Fund. Councilmember Courage asked about the current provider and how many total participants were served annually. Dovalina replied that Meals on Wheels was the

current provider and served 11,000 unduplicated participants over the course of the past year.

Chair Viagran expressed that this was an important safety net program for our senior citizens. Chair Viagran noted that the Item was for briefing only so no action was taken.

Post-Solicitation High Profile Briefings

- 5. Approval to proceed with scheduling ten contracts for City Council consideration to provide the City of San Antonio Metropolitan Health District with Vaccine Education Outreach Services in the estimated total value of \$1,080,000 for a contract term beginning upon award and ending June 30, 2025.** [Erik Walsh, City Manager; Claude A. Jacob, Director, Health]

Claude Jacob, Director of Metro Health provided the post-solicitation briefing for the Request for Proposals (RFP) issued for education services and outreach activities to share reliable information about vaccines. Jacob noted that of 1,679 vendors outreached, 12 responses were received, and one was deemed non-responsive due to making a campaign contribution during the blackout period. He recommended awarding 10 contracts under the RFP.

DISCUSSION:

Councilmember Courage clarified that 100% of the community needed to be covered by these 10 contracts and asked what would occur without these contracts. Jacob stated that most messaging was around the flu shot and in more traditional locations, but these contracts would allow a broader outreach.

Chair Viagran noted that the grant funding for this Program would help get more vendors involved in working with Metro Health and the City of San Antonio.

Councilmember Courage moved to forward the contracts to City Council A Session for consideration. Citizen Member Harris seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Harris
Absent: Trevino

- 6. Approval to proceed with scheduling one contract for City Council consideration to provide the San Antonio Police Department with the installation and storage services of ballistic glass windshields and side panel windows for the estimated total value of \$6,370,000 for a 3-year term, with 2, 1-year options to renew.** [María Villagómez, Deputy City Manager; Chief William McManus, Director, Police Department]

Rick Riley, Assistant Director for the San Antonio Police Department (SAPD) provided an overview of the Request for Competitive Sealed Proposals (RFCSP) which was to install and store ballistic glass windshields and side panel windows for specialty patrol vehicles. He noted that funding for this effort was approved in the FY2024 Budget. Riley stated that 88 vendors were notified, two attended the pre-submittal conference, and only one firm bid on

the contract. Riley recommended awarding the contract to the lone bidder.

DISCUSSION:

Councilmember Courage was surprised that only two firms attended the pre-submittal conference and only one responded. Riley stated that there were really two big players and one handled the Federal Government such as homeland security and the military. He indicated that the other firm handled more local and State Government. Councilmember Courage asked whether there were any Federal grants for this purpose. Riley stated that there were currently no grants but if some became available, SAPD would apply.

Councilmember Whyte clarified that this was General Fund money allocated over a year ago and he expressed concern that it had taken so long to get the protective glass. Riley stated that they had come to the Committee for pre-solicitation in April 2024 and they were currently 30 cars behind, but the firm committed to catching up.

Chair Viagran thanked Councilmember Castillo for making this a priority and hoped that this would make our officers safer.

Councilmember Whyte moved to forward the contract to City Council A Session for approval. Councilmember Courage seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Harris
Absent: Trevino

7. **Approval to proceed with scheduling one contract for City Council consideration to provide the San Antonio Public Library with Custodial Services in the estimated total value of \$9,200,000 for a 3 year term with 2, 1-year options to renew.** [David W. McCary, Assistant City Manager, City Manager's Office; Kathy Donellan, Interim Director, San Antonio Public Library]

Kathy Donnellan, Interim Director of the San Antonio Public Library (SAPL) explained that the Request for Competitive Sealed Proposals (RFCSP) was for a qualified vendor. She noted that the San Antonio Public Library (SAPL) solicited proposals for a qualified vendor to provide custodial services for twenty-seven (27) branch libraries. Donnellan indicated that these services would include routine cleaning, non-routine cleaning, and special cleaning tasks as requested. She stated that the selected vendor would also be responsible for providing on-demand cleaning services for the Central Library to support in-house staff when necessary. Donnellan added that all custodial services would be provided in a manner to ensure clean, safe, welcoming, and accessible library facilities, to uphold an excellent customer experience.

Donnellan stated that of the 4,736 firms that were notified, 44 attended the pre-submittal conference and 16 responded. She reported that nine firms were deemed non-responsive for failing to meet the SBEDA subcontracting requirements and one firm was deemed non-responsive for not providing a complete price schedule. Donnellan noted that following an initial evaluation, three firms were interviewed and the top-ranking firm was being recommended.

DISCUSSION:

Chair Viagran commented on the need for clean libraries. Councilmember Courage asked if the pricing could be negotiated. Elliott stated that this was essentially a statutory low-bid and there was little discretion for negotiation.

Councilmember Courage moved to forward the contract to City Council A Session for consideration. Councilmember Whyte seconded the motion.

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Harris
Absent: Trevino

Consideration of items for future meetings

Next Scheduled Meeting Date: December 10, 2024

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 10:48 a.m.

Approved

Phyllis Viagran, Chair

*Debbie Racca-Sittre
City Clerk*