

2024 Charter Review Commission

B Session
June 5, 2024



Commission's Charge



- Mayor Nirenberg's charging memo issued November 14, 2023
- Requested "that the Commission focus its efforts exclusively on the issues below for additional consideration. The Commission should submit its recommendations to the City Council by Friday, June 14, 2024."
- Issues included:
 - Ethics Officer and Other Ethics Revisions
 - City Council Member Compensation and Term Length
 - City Manager Tenure and Compensation
 - Council Districts and Redistricting
 - Language Modernization
- Second memo issued January 22, 2024 added Special Meetings (City Charter, Article II, Section 11) to the Commission's charge

Commission Makeup



Co-Chairs

- Bonnie Prosser Elder
- David Zammiello

- Cumulative of 400+ years professional, civic, and business experience
- Diverse expertise and demonstrated community leadership in the fields of education, local government and government affairs, HR, legal, finance, demography, engineering, and corporate and nonprofit leadership

Members

- Elva Pai Adams
- Josh Baugh
- Luisa Casso
- Frank Garza
- Mike Frisbie
- Pat Frost
- Martha Martinez-Flores
- Naomi Miller
- Bobby Perez
- Shelley Potter
- Dwayne Robinson
- Dr. Rogelio Sáenz
- María Salazar

Guiding Principles



As a Charter Review Commission, we operated under eight guiding principles:

1. Answer the charge
2. Focus on the future
3. Assume a clean canvas
4. Do the homework (subcommittee work is key)
5. Apply analytical and data-driven processes
6. Seek best practices
7. Share experience and expertise
8. Be transparent and listen

Meeting Protocols



Commission members are encouraged to share their insight, knowledge and experience and in doing so should understand and appreciate that others may have an equally relevant, important but different point of view that deserves respect.

Commission members should:

- recognize that their colleagues are individuals with a wide variety of backgrounds, personalities, values, opinions, and goals who have chosen to volunteer their time to this important effort
- be mindful of the content, tone and delivery of their words while asking a question or making a comment to others involved in this process
- respect the public and other members' speaking time
- practice civility, professionalism and decorum in discussions and debate

Commission Roadmap



Date	Deliverable
December 18	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Introductions and Scope
January 8	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Commission setup and subcommittees
January 25	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Baseline Review
February 8 and 22	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Research and Analysis
March 4 and 21	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Preliminary Recommendations
April 11 and 25	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Proposed Recommendations
May 6 and 9	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Final Recommendations and Commission Actions
May 20	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Other Matters and Commission Closeout

Subcommittees



Ethics officer and other ethics revisions

- Mike Frisbie, Chair

City Council compensation and term length

- Luisa Casso, Chair

City Manager tenure and compensation

- Pat Frost, Chair

Council districts and redistricting

- Frank Garza, Chair

Language modernization*

- Maria Salazar, Chair

* *Included evaluation of Special Meetings (City Charter, Article II, Section 11) charge*

Resource Summary

Cities – 10	Organizations – 10	People – 8	Data – 8
Dallas	Bexar County	Jason King, Ethics	Bureau of Labor Statistics
Fort Worth	CPS Energy	Patrick Lang, Ethics	US Census
Houston	SAWS	Dr. Steve Werling, Compensation	COSA salary data
Austin	Alamo College District	Ana Sandoval, Fmr. City Council	San Antonio Compensation Survey - CPS HR, a national HR consulting firm
El Paso	UTSA	William “Cruz” Shaw, Fmr. City Council	2022 ERB Annual Report
Corpus Christi	Brooks City Base	Rey Saldana, Fmr. City Council	ERB Recommended Code Revisions
Phoenix	Port San Antonio	Reed Williams, Fmr. City Council	Model City Charter, National Civic League
Philadelphia	University Health System	Charles E. Zech, Law	COSA Segal Waters 2018 Consulting Report
San Diego	VIA		
San Jose	UT – San Antonio		

Ethics Officer and Other Revisions



1. Whether the City should be able to appoint an independent ethics auditor with a legal background

- **Recommendation** – No charter amendment recommended. Leave Ethics Auditor position as is because current structure fosters a balance between independence and collaboration

2. Whether the Ethics Review Board should be autonomous with independent oversight and power to compel testimony, and whether any additional recommendations would strengthen the effectiveness, authority, and/or jurisdiction of the board

- **Recommendation** – Amended Charter to add the following:
 - high level definition of “conflicts of interest”
 - Appropriate sufficient funding for ERB to fulfill all duties
 - Remove term limits for ERB members
 - Increase ERB discretion to determine whether to accept or refuse complaint cases when complaints have been otherwise resolved

City Council Compensation and Term Length



3. City Council Term Length – Whether Mayoral or Mayoral and Council terms should be extended to four years with a limit of two terms, and whether such terms should be staggered

Recommendation – Amend the Charter to include four-year terms to run currently

- Total years of service should remain at eight years

4. City Council Member Compensation – Whether City Council members should be compensated on indexed terms that more accurately reflect the city’s cost of living and lower barriers to participation in City government

Recommendation:

- Amend the Charter to re-baseline City Council compensation to \$80,000 and to \$95,000 for Mayor compensation indexed to City of San Antonio wage increase percentage provided to civilian employees annually

Note: If approved, this proposal would go into effect after the next municipal election – ex. June 2025

City Manager Tenure and Compensation



5. City Manager Tenure – Whether the City Council should have the authority and discretion to hire, manage, and determine the length of service of the City Manager

- **Recommendation** – Amend the Charter to remove the language capping tenure

6. City Manager Compensation – Whether the City Council should determine the compensation of the City Manager so that market and competitive indicators are taken into account

- **Recommendation** – Amend the Charter to remove language capping compensation

Council Districts and Redistricting



7. Council Districts – Whether an increase in single-member Council districts would appropriately enhance representation for San Antonio residents

- **Recommendation:**

- No Charter amendment recommended at this time.
- Amend the Charter to add opportunity for redistricting if voters, through a future Charter election, amend and increase the number of districts. Charter currently states redistricting occurs after each Federal decennial census.

8. Redistricting – Whether the decennial Council redistricting process should be conducted by an independent, autonomous citizens committee and how such a committee’s membership shall be appointed

- **Recommendation** – Amend the Charter to create a redistricting commission including a provision on who can be appointed to the commission and requirement for supermajority of Council to amend the commission’s proposed redistricting plan.

Language Modernization



9. Whether the Charter shall be generally amended to update its language to more accurately reflect current processes, acknowledgments, and roles
- **Recommendation** – Amend 117 sections of the Charter containing outdated and superseded provisions

Special Meetings



10. Evaluate language that provides for special meetings of the City Council, and how those meetings should differ in purpose, use, and timing from the current policymaking process (Council Consideration Requests)

- **Recommendation** – No charter amendment recommended. Within Language Modernization, recommend striking calling of meeting by City Clerk, as City Manager’s Office and City Attorney’s Office now manage

Public Engagement

- 12 Commission meetings between December 2023 and May 2024
 - 5 public comment opportunities
 - 287 total attendees
- 10 Community presentations
 - San Antonio Hispanic Chamber of Commerce (x2)
 - South Texas Business Partnership
 - Historic Westside Residents Association
 - San Antonio Business Coalition
 - Barbara Gervin-Hawkins Power Breakfast
 - San Antonio Chapter of Associated General Contractors
 - Greater Chamber Public Policy Council (x2)
 - Real Estate Council of San Antonio

Public Input Summary

Meeting Date	Comments	Related to Subcommittee Work	Other
March 4	20	12	8
March 21	11	6	5
April 11	20	11	9
April 25	40	21	19
May 9	7	7	
SASpeakUp	85	58	27
Totals	183	115	68

Top three topics outside of charge were:

1. 20% of future revenue growth for youth programs
2. Ranked choice voting
3. City employee participation in council member elections

Communication Efforts

- Media materials:
 - Press release/requests for coverage
 - Media interviews with Commission Co-Chairs
- Social media posts:
 - Social media videos
 - Social media ads
- Grassroots:
 - City-wide text messages
 - Discussions with local organizations
 - Email outreach to City lists and stakeholder groups
 - Distribution of flyers
 - Digital signage at City facilities and kiosks



Public Comment Communications

- Social Media
 - 64 posts
 - 500,000 Impressions
- Social Media Ad Impressions
 - Meta – 1.14M +
 - YouTube – 128,000 +
- TV/Radio Interviews



Email Reach

- Issued March 6, April 3 and May 7
- **19,044** total recipients
- Average Open Rate:
 - SASpeakUp: **80%**
 - NEB: **85%**



Neighborhood Engagement Brief
April 2024

Charter Review Commission wants to hear from you!
Any of the following topics:

Ethics Review
Should an independent ethics officer and/or Ethics Review Charter be amended to give the Ethics Review

Term and Tenure
Council members' compensation more accurately reflect the changes that could lower financial barriers to participation in the Charter process?
Should a council member serve a maximum of four two-year terms. Should two-year terms, and should those terms be

Compensation
Should council members' tenure and compensation be determined by the City Council?
Redistricting
Should there be more council districts? The City currently has 10 council districts. Is the Mayor serving at-large over the entire city. Is more to be added?
Should there be an independent redistricting committee? If so, how should it be structured?

Should the Charter be updated to reflect current issues?

Public Comment for Charter Review Commission

Participate in the City Charter review process by attending public comment sessions in April, or sharing your input online or by calling 3-1-1.

[Learn More](#)

Flyer Distributions

- 10 City Council Offices
- 24 Community Centers
- 31 Libraries
- 11 Senior Centers

Reach

- 76 locations
- 2,500 flyers distributed
- English & Spanish



Conclusion

- Responded to the charge
- Applied a researched-based approach
- Embraced guiding principles and protocols
- Enabled community engagement
- Resulted in unanimous approval of all commission recommendations



THANK YOU!

