

City of San Antonio



Minutes Audit Committee

2023 – 2025 Council Members

Chair: Phyllis Viagran, District 3

John Courage, District 9 | Marc Whyte, District 10

Citizen Representative Dr. Judy Trevino and Philip M. Harris

Tuesday, September 10, 2024

10:00 AM

Council Briefing Room at

City Hall Complex

The Audit Committee convened a regular meeting in the City Hall Council Briefing Room beginning at 10:01 AM. City Clerk, Debbie Racca-Sittre took the Roll Call noting a quorum with the following Committee Members present:

Members Present: Phyllis Viagran, *Chair*
John Courage, *Member*
Marc Whyte, *Member*
Dr. Judy Trevino, *Citizen Member*
Philip Harris, *Citizen Member*

Members Absent: None

Approval of Minutes

1. Approval of minutes from the August 13, 2024 Audit Committee Meeting

Councilmember Courage moved to Approve the minutes of the August 13, 2024 Audit Committee meeting. Councilmember Whyte seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Trevino, Harris

Public Comments

There were no public comments.

CONSENT AGENDA

Final Internal Audit Reports

2. Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor Report AU24-004 Audit of BESD Fueling Facilities [Kevin W. Barthold, City Auditor]

Councilmember Courage moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Councilmember Whyte seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Trevino, Harris

3. Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor Report AU24-005 Audit of CCDO Go Rio San Antonio Contract Monitoring [Kevin W. Barthold, City Auditor]

Councilmember Courage moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Councilmember Whyte seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Trevino, Harris

4. Acceptance of the Office of the City Auditor Report AU24-029 Audit of Parks and Recreation Department Outdoor Equipment Maintenance [Kevin W. Barthold, City Auditor]

Councilmember Courage moved to Approve on the Consent Agenda. Councilmember Whyte seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Trevino, Harris

ITEMS FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

Pre-Solicitation High Profile Briefings

5. **Briefing on the release of a solicitation for one contract to provide the Public Works Department with construction services for the Fire Station #52 Replacement project in the estimated total value of \$9,355,000.** [John Peterek, Interim Assistant City Manager; Razi Hosseini, Director, Public Works Department]

Christie Chapman, Assistant Public Works Director reported that the Public Works Department was issuing a Request for Competitive Sealed Proposals (RFCSP) for the construction of improvements to Fire Station #52, located in Council District 4 at 10440 Quintana Road and funded by Certificates of Obligation. Chapman provided an overview of the solicitation, evaluation panelists, and scoring criteria including 30 points for Experience, 20 points for the Proposed Plan, 15 points for past performance and experience with the San Antonio Region, 15 points for Pricing, and 10 points each for Small Business Enterprise (SBE) Prime Contract and Minority/Woman Business Enterprise (M/WBE) Prime Contract Program. Chapman reported that there was a Small Business Economic Development Advocacy Program (SBEDA) subcontracting requirements of 16% for M/WBE and 4% for African American Business Enterprise (AABE) and there was a Small Business Economic Development Advocacy Program (SBEDA) subcontracting requirements of 16% for M/WBE and 4% for African American Business

Enterprise (AABE). Chapman stated that the RFCSP was planned for release on September 20, 2024 with responses due on November 8, 2024 and a contract was expected to begin in March 2024 following City Council approval.

Chair Viagran recommended accelerating the schedule as Fire Stations were important to our community. Chief Financial Officer Ben Gorzell stated that the solicitation timeline was relatively aggressive with 45 days for the solicitation to be on the street as previously recommended by the Committee but he assured the Chair that the procurement team would work to keep on schedule.

Item was for briefing so no action was taken.

- 6. Briefing on the release of a solicitation for one contract to provide the Public Works Department with construction services for the Fire Station #53 Replacement project in the estimated total value of \$9,433,000.** [John Peterek, Interim Assistant City Manager; Razi Hosseini, Director, Public Works Department]

Christie Chapman, Assistant Public Works Director reported that the Public Works Department was issuing a Request for RFCSP for the construction of improvements to Fire Station #53. She indicated that this project, located in Council District 3 at 14102 Donop Road, was funded by Certificates of Obligation. Chapman provided an overview of the solicitation, evaluation panelists, and scoring criteria including 30 points for Experience, 20 points for the Proposed Plan, 15 points for past performance and experience with the San Antonio Region, 15 points for pricing, and 10 points each for Small Business Enterprise (SBE) Prime Contract and Minority/Woman Business Enterprise (M/WBE) Prime Contract Program. She reported that there was a Small Business Economic Development Advocacy Program (SBEDA) subcontracting requirements of 16% for M/WBE and 4% for African American Business Enterprise (AABE) and there was a Small Business Economic Development Advocacy Program (SBEDA) subcontracting requirements of 16% for M/WBE and 4% for African American Business Enterprise (AABE). Chapman stated that the RFCSP was planned for release on September 20, 2024 with responses due on November 8, 2024 with the contract expected to begin in March 2024 following City Council approval.

Chair Viagran noted that the Fire Station was in Council District 3 and there was currently a temporary facility. She stressed that the building needed to last 20+ years and there were clay soils in the area affecting infrastructure and foundations. She recommended inclusion of electric vehicle (EV) charging stations and consideration of the community needs even though this was a rural area, growth and development were coming.

Item was for briefing so no action was taken.

Post-Solicitation High Profile Briefings

- 7. Approval to proceed with scheduling one contract for City Council consideration to provide the Parks and Recreation Department with mowing services for parks and historical cemeteries in the estimated total value of \$13,000,000 for 3 years with 2, 1-year options to renew.** [David W. McCary, Assistant City Manager; Homer Garcia III, Parks and Recreation Department]

Melinda Cerda, Assistant Parks & Recreation department Director stated that the department had issued a Request for Competitive Sealed Proposals (RFCSP) for a contractor to provide mowing services to parks, trailheads, greenways, sports fields, and historic cemeteries throughout the city. Cerda listed the evaluation panelists and scoring criteria. She noted that 588 vendors were notified, six attended the pre-submittal conference, and five responses were received; out of the five, two were nonresponsive due to not meeting the SBEDA subcontracting requirement and another vendor withdrew their bid leaving two vendors that were scored.

Councilmember Courage was amazed that out of 588 vendors, only six bids were received and asked why there was not more interest and was also concerned that two did not come up with enough subcontractors. Deputy Chief Financial Officer Troy Elliott stated that staff could ask non-respondents why they did not bid, however, the project was divided into nine sectors and de-bundled into manageable portions. Gorzell commented that many of the 588 vendors listed under the codes that were within the project so there may be a lot of vendors that self-selected out of bidding on the mowing services because they really could not provide the specific scope.

Councilmember Whyte suggested using a robotic company like Renew Robotics to mow the parks. Elliott stated that robotic companies could bid on the project but the solicitation did not specify that they must be robots.

Chair Viagran recommended referring SBEDA and Supply SA outreach to the Economic & Workforce Development Committee and wanted to ensure other committees looked at the components of contracts pertinent to their scope.

Councilmember Courage asked if Public Works would be getting a new mowing contract as well. Elliott explained that there were other mowing contracts and the comments and feedback received today would be considered.

Citizen Member Trevino moved to Approve. Citizen Member Harris seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Trevino, Harris

- 8. Approval to proceed with scheduling two contracts for City Council consideration to provide the Transportation Department with on-call professional consulting services for marketing and communication in the estimated total value of \$2,450,000 for 3 years with 2, 1-year options to renew.** [John Peterek, Interim Assistant City Manager; Catherine Hernandez, Director, Transportation]

Catherine Hernandez, Director of the Transportation Department stated that the department had issued a Request for Competitive Sealed Proposals (RFCSP) for a contractor to provide marketing and graphic design services for community outreach. Cerda listed the evaluation panelists and scoring criteria. She noted that 1,345 vendors were notified, six attended the pre-submittal conference, and five responses were received; out of the five, two were nonresponsive due to not meeting the SBEDA subcontracting requirement and another vendor withdrew their bid leaving two vendors that were scored.

Councilmember Whyte requested clarification on the programs that would be marketed using the contracts. Hernandez stated that it was for marketing for the safe streets and 10 safety campaigns through a Federal grant and other marketing for the department.

Councilmember Courage asked why there were two contracts. Hernandez stated that \$1.25 million was for the Federal grant programs and the other contract would be for on-call services for typical public engagement activities.

Chair Viagran supported the use of community surveys and recommended community awareness campaigns for jaywalking and other safety issues. She recommended that the messaging be in English, Spanish, and other languages based on having refugee communities throughout the City. She recommended that an evaluation of the vendors be shared with other departments because they often hired their own firms.

Councilmember Courage moved to Approve. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Trevino, Harris

Consideration of items for future meetings

Next Scheduled Meeting Date: October 8, 2024

Chair Viagran suggested including Items on a future meeting that would develop recommendations to refer Items to other City Council Committees.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 10:35 a.m.

Approved

Phyllis Viagran, Chair

Debbie Racca-Sittre
City Clerk