

# City of San Antonio



## Minutes

### Audit Committee

2023 – 2025 Council Members

Chair: Phyllis Viagran, District 3

John Courage, District 9 | Marc Whyte, District 10

Citizen Representative Dr. Judy Trevino and Philip M. Harris

Friday, February 28, 2025

2:00 PM

Council Briefing Room at  
City Hall Complex

The Audit Committee convened a regular meeting in the City Hall Council Briefing Room beginning at 2:03 p.m. City Clerk Debbie Racca-Sittre took the Roll Call noting a quorum with the following Committee Members present:

**Members Present:** Phyllis Viagran, *Chair*  
John Courage, *Member*  
Marc Whyte, *Member*  
Dr. Judy Trevino, *Citizen Member*  
Philip Harris, *Citizen Member*

**Members Absent:** None

### Approval of Minutes

#### 1. Approval of minutes from the January 14, 2025 Audit Committee Meeting

Councilmember Harris moved to Approve the minutes of the January 14, 2025, Audit Committee meeting. Councilmember Courage seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Viagran, Courage, Harris  
**Absent:** Whyte, Trevino

### Public Comments

There were no public comments.

### CONSENT AGENDA

### Final Internal Audit Reports

## ITEMS FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

### Post-Solicitation High Profile Briefings

2. **Approval to proceed with scheduling six contracts for City Council consideration to provide the Neighborhood and Housing Services Department with Lead Abatement Contractor Services in the estimated total value of \$6,500,000 for 2 years with 3, 1-year options to renew.** [Lori Houston, Assistant City Manager; Veronica Garcia, Director, Neighborhood and Housing Services]

Veronica Gonzalez, Assistant Director of the Neighborhood and Housing Services Department (NHSD) stated that the department solicited a Request for Proposals (RFP) for Lead-Based Paint Remediation Services. She noted that the initiative supported San Antonio's Green and Healthy Homes Program (SAGHHP), which aimed to address lead hazards in homes where children were at risk of lead poisoning through the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) Lead Hazard Reduction Grant (LHRG) Program. Gonzalez indicated that the lead abatement services also extended to the Owner-Occupied Rehabilitation and Minor Repair Program.

Gonzalez listed the evaluation criteria and evaluation panelists and provided a scoring matrix for all seven proposals received from the 434 vendors notified. She recommended that contracts be awarded to six of the seven firms scoring above 65.

### DISCUSSION:

Chair Viagran was pleased that there were seven applicants and that six were being recommended. She asked if the City tracked whether the vendor was holding to the pricing they submitted. Deputy Chief Financial Officer Troy Elliott explained that vendors needed to follow their contract and the pricing was verified with each Task Order. In addition, Elliott stated that the City Auditor periodically audited utilization of the vendors to ensure fair rotation of Task Orders. Chair Viagran noted that this was a very important program to protect children in our community.

Citizen Member Harris moved to Approve. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Trevino, Harris

3. **Approval to proceed with scheduling nine contracts for City Council consideration to provide the Development Services Department with Vacant Lot Abatement Services in the estimated total value of \$3,298,660 for an initial 1 year term with 4, 1-year options to renew.** [John Peterek, Interim Assistant City Manager; Michael Shannon, PE, CBO, Director, Development Services]

Mike Shannon, Director of Development Services (DSD), stated that the department issued a solicitation to select up to nine contractors for the clearing and securing of structures on an "as-needed" basis. He reported that the services included mowing and clearing premises, cutting grass and weeds, removing brush, rubbish, rocks, bricks, and trash, painting over graffiti, and clearing debris.

The five current vacant lot contracts were set to expire in October 2025. Shannon listed the evaluation criteria and evaluation panelists and provided a scoring matrix for all 15 proposals received from the 803 vendors notified. Shannon recommended the nine highest scoring proposals for contract.

#### DISCUSSION:

Councilmember Whyte expressed concern that four of the vendors scored below 60 out of 100, which he felt was failing. Shannon explained that some of the vendors were very small with only one or two employees, and it was important to have those small and new vendors to perform very small vacant lot cleanup with larger cleanup projects going to larger firms. Shannon added that if they did not perform, their contract could be suspended or cancelled. Councilmember Whyte asked if those vendors had been used before. Shannon stated that one of the four lower scoring vendors had worked with the City before. Shannon also noted that some of the firms did not receive the points for the Small Business Economic Development Advocacy (SBEDA) program or veterans.

Chair Viagran explained that the Audit Committee did not get to see the names of the vendors because that step was reserved for City Council. She did not feel comfortable removing the small businesses from the list since some of these vacant lot cleanup jobs were very small so she recommended giving them a chance and if the vendor did not perform, they could be removed. She noted that it was taking a long time to get the vacant lots abated and it was important to have a significant number of local firms, so she supported the recommended nine vendors.

Chief Financial Officer Ben Gorzell noted that the scope included a large variety of services and sometimes smaller firms did not perform all services so they might have scored lower and as DSD assigned the work, they would look at what the vendor might be best assigned.

Councilmember Whyte expressed concern with Vendor F receiving only 13 out of 30 points for proposed plan and 13 out of 35 for experience.

Citizen Member Trevino moved to Approve. Citizen Member Harris seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Viagran, Courage, Trevino, Harris  
**No:** Whyte

4. **Approval to proceed with scheduling five contracts for City Council consideration to provide the Development Services Department with Dangerous Premise Abatement Lot Clean and Securing of Structures services in the estimated total value of \$4,239,150 for an initial 1 year term with 4, 1- year options to renew.** [John Peterek, Interim Assistant City Manager; Michael Shannon, PE, CBO, Director, Development Services]

Mike Shannon, Director of Development Services (DSD) stated that the department issued a solicitation to select contractors for clearing and securing of structures on an “as needed” basis to secure accessible structures, attach plywood to first floor windows and doors, mow and clear premises, mow grass and weeds, remove brush, rubbish, rocks, bricks and trash, paint over

graffiti, and clear debris.

Shannon indicated that the current vacant structure contracts were set to expire in June 2025. He listed the evaluation criteria and evaluation panelists and provided a scoring matrix for all seven proposals received from the 802 vendors notified. Shannon recommended five contracts to the highest scoring firms.

#### DISCUSSION:

Councilmember Whyte noted that Vendor E scored 49 out of 100 points and only 14 out of 30 on their proposed plan. Councilmember Whyte asked if DSD was having difficulty finding vendors to do the work. Shannon confirmed that this was a challenging contract to get vendors to want to do the work and since there was so much work, almost 1,000 work orders every year, that multiple vendors were needed. Councilmember Whyte noted a road contract in his council district where a contractor walked off the job. Shannon explained that these were single day jobs and the contractor did not get paid until their work was verified, and over time, if a vendor underperformed, they would be removed from the list.

Councilmember Courage appreciated the difficulty in finding vendors to do the work and the need to hold them accountable. Councilmember Courage requested a report on the success of the last group and what changes were made to the process to ensure we had better contracts and vendors this time.

Chair Viagran was pleased that the Small Business Economic Development Advocacy (SBEDA) and local preference points were included as there was more accountability when local vendors performed the work.

Councilmember Courage moved to Approve. Citizen Member Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Viagran, Courage, Trevino, Harris  
**No:** Whyte

5. **Approval to proceed with scheduling one contract for City Council consideration to provide the Development Services Department with biological services in support of the Southern Edwards Plateau Habitat Conservation Plan for an estimated annual contract value not to exceed \$340,000 for one year, with five, one-year options to renew for an estimated total value of \$2,040,000 over 6 years.** [John Peterek, Interim Assistant City Manager; Michael Shannon, PE, CBO, Director, Development Services Department]

Mike Shannon, Director of the Development Services Department (DSD) stated that the department issued a Request for Qualifications (RFQ) seeking a U.S. Fish and Wildlife (USFW) certified biologist and/or environmental company with experience in implementing Habitat Conservation Plans to support the operation, administration, management, and coordination of the Southern Edwards Plateau Habitat Conservation Plan administered by DSD.

According to Shannon, the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service had issued a joint 30-year incidental

take permit between the City of San Antonio and Bexar County and Bexar County awarded the current contract, which expired on February 28, 2025, and now the City of San Antonio was going to take over the contract as agreed with the County. Shannon reported that there was one responsive bidder out of the 169 vendors that were outreached since this was a specialty contract. He recommended award of the contract to the one biologist who submitted their qualifications, which happened to be the current contract holder.

#### DISCUSSION:

There was no committee discussion.

Councilmember Whyte moved to Approve. Councilmember Courage seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Trevino, Harris

- 6. Approval to proceed with scheduling one contract for City Council consideration to provide the San Antonio Fire Department with construction services for the Fire Station #52 Replacement project, located in Council District 4 at 10440 Quintana Road in the estimated total value of \$9,350,000.** [John Peterek, Interim Assistant City Manager; Razi Hosseini, Director, Public Works Department].

Luis Maltos, Assistant Public Works Director stated that the department issued a Request for Competitive Sealed Proposals (RFCSP) for construction services for the Fire Station #52 Replacement Project located in Council District 4 at 10440 Quintana Road, which would be funded with Certificates of Obligation. He noted that the fire station was planned to include an Emergency Medical Services (EMS) bay, sleeping quarters for the assigned crew, apparatus bays, support equipment bunker, gym, kitchen, and common area.

Maltos reported that six proposals were received from the 92 vendors notified, one firm withdrew their submittal, one firm was initially deemed non-responsive for failure to meet the African American Business Enterprise (AABE) subcontracting goal so only four firms were scored. He indicated that after scoring and interviews were complete, a third firm was disqualified due for making prohibited campaign contributions. Maltos recommended awarding the contract to the top ranked firm that was not disqualified.

#### DISCUSSION:

Councilmember Whyte requested explanation on the AABE goal and who set it. Maltos stated that this was a goal for the prime contractor to subcontract a certain percentage to AABEs. Deputy Chief Financial Officer, Troy Elliott explained that the Finance Procurement Division and Small Business Division of the Economic Development Department (EDD) followed a formula using availability and utilization to determine the small business goal using the National Institute of Governmental Purchasing (NIGP) Commodity Book Codes.

Citizen Member Trevino asked if the campaign contribution was made in between the first and second evaluation round. Elliott stated that the contribution was discovered after the evaluation

had been completed; had it been discovered before the evaluation took place, the vendor would not have been scored nor presented in the scoring matrix.

Chair Viagran commented that staff reminded vendors about the blackout period. Gorzell mentioned that the procurement division posted a list of upcoming solicitations online to help ensure vendors could plan.

Citizen Member Harris moved to Approve. Councilmember Courage seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Trevino, Harris

7. **Approval to proceed with scheduling one contract for City Council consideration to provide the San Antonio Fire Department with construction services for the Fire Station #53 Replacement project, located in Council District 3 at 14102 Donop Road in the estimated total value of \$9,433,000.** [John Peterek, Interim Assistant City Manager; Razi Hosseini, Director, Public Works Department].

Luis Maltos, Assistant Public Works Director stated that the department issued a Request for Competitive Sealed Proposals (RFCSP) for construction services for the Fire Station #53 Replacement Project located in Council District 3 at 14102 Donop Road, which was funded with Certificates of Obligation. He noted that the fire station was planned to include an Emergency Medical Services (EMS) bay, sleeping quarters for the assigned crew, apparatus bays, support equipment bunker, gym, kitchen, and common area.

Maltos reported that six proposals were received from the 92 vendors notified, and were initially scored, however two were disqualified for making prohibited campaign contributions. He noted that one of the disqualified firms had made it to the interview phase and was disqualified after the interview. Maltos recommended awarding the contract to the top ranked firm that was not disqualified.

#### DISCUSSION:

There was no committee discussion.

Citizen Member Trevino moved to Approve. Councilmember Whyte seconded the motion. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** Viagran, Courage, Whyte, Trevino, Harris

#### Consideration of items for future meetings

Next Scheduled Meeting Date: March 11, 2025

Chair Viagran announced that the next meeting would be held on March 28, 2025 due to Spring Break the week of March 11<sup>th</sup>.

## **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 2:52 p.m.

**Approved**

---

*Phyllis Viagran, Chair*

*Debbie Racca-Sittre  
City Clerk*