



CITY OF SAN ANTONIO
OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION

**HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES
WEDNESDAY, January 15, 2025**

The City of San Antonio Historic and Design Review Commission (**HDRC**) met on Wednesday, January 15, 2025, at 1901 South Alamo Street, San Antonio, Texas 78204.

MEETING CALLED TO ORDER:

Chair Gibbs called the meeting to order at 3:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

PRESENT: Castillo (virtual), Savino, Velásquez, Mazuca, Cervantes, Fetzer, and Gibbs

ABSENT: Galloway, Guevara, Grube, and Holland

- Commissioner Holland arrived at 3:02 p.m.
- Commissioner Grube arrived at 3:20 p.m.

CHAIR'S STATEMENT:

Chair Gibbs provided a statement regarding meeting processes, appeals, time limits, decorum.

ANNOUNCEMENT:

- Spanish interpreter services available to the public during the hearing.
- Item 11 was withdrawn by the applicant.

ELECTION OF OFFICERS:

MOTION: Commissioner Velásquez motioned to elect J. Maurice Gibbs as Chair.
(Chair) Vice Chair Fetzer seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Castillo, Savino, Velásquez, Mazuca, Cervantes, Holland, Fetzer, and Gibbs
NAY: None
ABSENT: Galloway, Guevara and Grube

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 8 AYES. 0 NAYS. 3 ABSENT.**

MOTION: Commissioner Savino motioned to elect Jeffrey Fetzer as Vice Chair.
(Vice Chair) Commissioner Velásquez seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Castillo, Savino, Velásquez, Mazuca, Cervantes, Holland, Fetzer, and Gibbs
NAY: None
ABSENT: Galloway, Guevara and Grube

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 8 AYES. 0 NAYS. 3 ABSENT.**

APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:

MOTION: Vice Chair Fetzer moved to approve HDRC meeting minutes for December 18, 2024.
Commissioner Cervantes seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Castillo, Savino, Velásquez, Mazuca, Cervantes, Holland, Fetzer, and Gibbs
NAY: None
ABSENT: Galloway, Guevara and Grube

ACTION: MOTION PASSED with 8 AYES. 0 NAYS. 3 ABSENT.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

- Phyllis McNair, President of the Dignowity Hill Neighborhood Association submitted a letter for general comments with the update that the Dignowity Hill Architectural Review Committee has been renamed to the Dignowity Hill Historic Neighborhood Review Committee (HNRC).
- Item 4 – Kate Ruckman, on behalf of the Conservation Society of San Antonio, submitted a voicemail requesting justification for relocating the two-story historic house at 1602 Broadway/1611 N. Alamo rather than repurposing it as an authentic part of the planned development. The letter also included a request for clarification the individual landmark house across the street at 1606 N. Alamo is part of a future phase of development.
- Item 4 – The Conservation Society of San Antonio submitted a letter with the same information outlined in the voicemail.
- Item 6 – Lulu Francois on behalf of the Dignowity Hill Historic Neighborhood Review Committee, submitted a voicemail in support of the case.
- Item 6 – submitted a letter with the same information outlined in the voicemail.

CONSENT AGENDA:

Chair Gibbs asked if any commissioner would like to pull items from the Consent Agenda.

- Commissioner Cervantes requested Items 2 and 3 be pulled from the Consent Agenda for individual consideration.
- Vice Chair Fetzer requested Item 4 be pulled from the Consent Agenda for individual consideration.
- Commissioner Savino requested Item 8 be pulled from the Consent Agenda for individual consideration.

MOTION: Vice Chair Fetzer moved to approve items 1, 5, 6, 7, and 9 with staff stipulations.
Commissioner Savino seconded the motion.

Items on Consent:

Item 1, Case No. 2024-409
Item 5, Case No. 2024-416
Item 6, Case No. 2024-423

Item 7, Case No. 2025-002
Item 9, Case No. 2025-001

115 WICKES
331 W ELSMERE PLACE
801 N OLIVE ST
701 NOLAN ST
234 W WOODLAWN AVE
362 E HUISACHE AVE

VOTE: AYE: Castillo, Savino, Velásquez, Mazuca, Cervantes, Holland, Fetzer, and Gibbs
 NAY: None
 ABSENT: Galloway, Guevara and Grube

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 8 AYES. 0 NAYS. 3 ABSENT.**

INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION ITEMS:

ITEM 2. HDRC NO. 2024-425
 ADDRESS: 2419 MCCULLOUGH AVE
 APPLICANT: Scott Carpenter/Seventh Generation Design, Inc.

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval of the following scopes of work at 2419 McCullough:

1. Demolish the existing, rear accessory structure that originally served as servant's quarters.
2. Construct a new, rear accessory structure to the immediate south of the primary historic structure on site.
3. Reconstruct the historic structure's front porch using salvaged and in-kind materials.
4. Perform rehabilitative scopes of work including window and door repair, siding and foundation skirting repair, structural foundation repair, and the installation of a standing seam metal roof and new gutters and downspouts.
5. Convert one, side window into a door opening to provide egress.
6. Replace six (6) existing, dormer windows with ventilation grilles.
7. Enclose the rear, 2-story porch and construct a 2-story, rear addition in the location of the existing, rear porch.
8. Install a retaining wall featuring fencing and masonry planters at the property's perimeter along McCullough and Woodlawn to replace existing, non-uniform fencing elements.
9. Install a monument sign at the corner of McCullough and Woodlawn.
10. Install a new sidewalk on Woodlawn, parallel to the street and make sit improvements at the corner of McCullough and Woodlawn.
11. Perform on site paving to introduce accessible pathways and ramps throughout the campus.
12. Create an outdoor gathering deck/terrace to the south of the primary historic structure on site.
13. Perform landscaping work including the installation of various trees throughout the site.

RECOMMENDATION:

1. Staff recommends approval of item #1, the demolition of the existing, rear accessory structure based on findings c through e with the following stipulations:
 - i. That the structure be deconstructed by a Certified Deconstruction Contractor, as required by the Chapter 12, Article II of the City Code of Ordinances.
 - ii. That materials be salvaged and considered for reuse on site.
2. Staff recommends approval of item #2, the construction of a new, rear accessory structure, based on findings f through j, as submitted.
3. Staff recommends approval of item #3, the reconstruction of the historic structure's front porch, based on finding k, as submitted.
4. Staff recommends approval of item #4, rehabilitative scopes of work, based on finding l, as submitted.

5. Staff recommends approval of item #5, the conversion of an original window opening to a door opening, based on finding m, as submitted.
6. Staff recommends approval of item #6, the replacement of six (6) dormer windows with ventilation grilles, based on finding n, with the following stipulation:
 - i. That grilles should be painting in a manner that is consistent with the material and color palette of the rehabilitated structure.
7. Staff recommends approval of item #7, the enclosure of the 2-story, rear porch and the construction of a rear addition, based on findings o through q, with the following stipulations:
 - i. That the proposed wood windows adhere to the adopted standards for windows in new construction.
8. Staff recommends approval of item #8, the installation of a retaining wall featuring fencing and masonry planters, based on finding r, as submitted.
9. Staff recommends approval of item #9, the installation of a monument sign at the corner of McCullough and Woodlawn based on finding s, with the following stipulations:
 - i. That the proposed sign feature indirect illumination.
10. Staff recommends approval of item #10, the installation of a new sidewalk on Woodlawn, based on finding r, with the following stipulation:
 - i. That the proposed sidewalk match the existing sidewalks on Woodlawn regarding material and finish.
11. Staff recommends approval of item #11, on site paving, as submitted, based on finding u.
12. Staff recommends approval of item #12, the construction of an outdoor deck/terrace, based on finding v, as submitted
13. Staff recommends approval of item #13, landscaping and tree planting, based on finding w, as submitted.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

MOTION: Vice Chair Fetzer moved to approve with staff stipulations.
Commissioner Velásquez seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Castillo, Savino, Velásquez, Mazuca, Cervantes, Holland, Fetzer, and Gibbs
NAY: None
ABSENT: Galloway, Guevara and Grube

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 8 AYES. 0 NAYS. 3 ABSENT.**

ITEM 3. HDRC NO. 2024-424
ADDRESS: 1210 E ELMIRA ST
APPLICANT: Michael Elder

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a nine-story hotel structure on the lot addressed as 1210 E Elmira. This lot is bounded by Schiller Street to the south, E Elmira Street to the west, Myrtle Street to the north and the San Antonio River to the east. This lot is located within the River Improvement Overlay, District 2. The proposed hotel will feature 166 guest rooms and approximately 7,500 square feet of meeting space.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through t with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant completes coordination with the San Antonio River Authority in regards to regarding direct access to the San Antonio River, landscaping and maintenance boundaries and storm water control measures, as noted in finding d.
- ii. That all windows feature external muntins and that frame colors do not feature manufacturer's white.
- iii. ARCHAEOLOGY – An archaeological investigation is required. The project shall comply with all federal, state, and local laws, rules, and regulations regarding archaeology, as applicable.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

MOTION: Commissioner Savino moved to approve with staff stipulations.
Commissioner Velásquez seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Castillo, Savino, Velásquez, Mazuca, Cervantes, Holland, and Gibbs
NAY: None
ABSENT: Galloway, Guevara and Grube
RECUSED: Fetzer

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 7 AYES. 0 NAYS. 3 ABSENT. 1 RECUSAL.**

ITEM 4. HDRC NO. 2024-426
ADDRESS: 1602 BROADWAY
1702 BROADWAY/1702 BROADWAY, 1611 N ALAMO,
1613 N ALAMO
APPLICANT: Mark Henderson/Ford Powell and Carson

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval for approval to:

1. Relocate the two-story, historic structure, to a lot within the Government Hill Historic District. The applicant has not specified the lot at this time.
2. Construct a mixed-use development to feature a total of six (6) buildings to feature two and three stories in height. The proposed new construction will be bounded by Broadway to the west, North Alamo to the east, and Casa Blanca to the south. An extension of Pearl Parkway will extend east through the project site to intersect with N Alamo.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends conceptual of request items #1 and #2 based on findings a through s with the following stipulations:

- i. That the relocation location for the historic structure at 1611 N Alamo be determined prior to returning to the Commission for final approval of the proposed new construction, as noted in finding d. These details should include a detailed construction document set, the cataloging of decorative architectural elements and building components and a detailed plan for the physical relocation and any associated deconstruction or disassembly of the structure to facilitate the proposed relocation. The new location must also be designated by the owner as a local historic landmark.
- ii. That a detailed landscaping plan should be developed and submitted for review and approval prior to returning to the Commission for final approval, as noted in finding h.
- iii. That all mechanical and service equipment be screened and comply with UDC standards, as noted in finding i.

- iv. That final materials specifications be submitted for review and approval when returning to the Commission for final approval, as noted in finding o.
- v. That window specifications be submitted for review and approval. Non curtain wall system glazing elements should be installed at least two (2) inches within walls.
- vi. That both architectural and landscape lighting plans be submitted for review and approval prior to returning to the Commission for final approval, as noted in finding q.
- vii. ARCHAEOLOGY – The project shall comply with all federal, state, and local laws, rules, and regulations regarding archaeology, as applicable.

PUBLIC COMMENT: Provided at the beginning of the meeting.

MOTION: Commissioner Savino moved for conceptual approval with staff stipulations.
Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Castillo, Savino, Velásquez, Mazuca, Grube, Cervantes, Holland, Fetzer, and Gibbs
NAY: None
ABSENT: Galloway and Guevara

ACTION: **MOTION PASSED with 9 AYES. 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT.**

ITEM 8. HDRC NO. 2024-420
ADDRESS: 301 BRAHAN BLVD
APPLICANT: Ben Bowman/Assets and Architects

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Modify the existing primary entry sequence on Southern (front) façade by removing existing flatwork and installing a raised open patio accessed by stairs on three sides and replace front door with a solid wood door.
2. Open the existing rear enclosed service porch and replace with a double-height volume featuring an open balcony at the second floor and install a raised open patio at the rear of the primary structure spanning the structure's width.
3. Modify existing fenestration pattern on Northern (rear) façade.
4. Repair existing casita with in-kind materials.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the proposal based on findings a through g with the following stipulation:

- i. That the applicant submit product specifications for the front door replacement and photos of the existing windows and garage doors of the casita.
- ii. That the applicant salvage as much existing material as possible, including structural members, windows, and doors for reuse on site, resale, or donation.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

MOTION: Vice Chair Fetzer moved to approve with stipulations:
i. That the applicant submit product specifications for the front door replacement and photos of the existing windows and garage doors of the casita.

- ii. That the applicant salvage as much existing material as possible, including structural members, windows, and doors for reuse on site, resale, or donation.
- iii. That the applicant install two wrought iron railings on either side of the stairs facing Brahan in keeping with the architectural language of the home. Applicant to submit product specifications or design drawings of said railing.

Commissioner Savino seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Castillo, Savino, Velásquez, Mazuca, Grube, Cervantes, Holland, Fetzer, and Gibbs
NAY: None
ABSENT: Galloway and Guevara

ACTION: MOTION PASSED with 9 AYES. 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT.

ITEM 10. HDRC NO. 2023-475
ADDRESS: 222 S ALAMO ST
APPLICANT: Michael Monceaux/Overland Partners

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to amend the previously approved design and stipulation of approval regarding the screening of rooftop mechanical equipment.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends the applicant either install an architectural screening element as previously recommended and approval, or that the applicant explore and propose an alternative solution that results in rooftop mechanical equipment being screened, resulting in visually unobstructive rooftop elements.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

MOTION: Commissioner Holland moved to approve as submitted.
Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Castillo, Velásquez, Mazuca, Grube, Cervantes, Holland, and Gibbs
NAY: Savino and Fetzer
ABSENT: Galloway and Guevara

ACTION: MOTION PASSED with 7 AYES. 2 NAYS. 2 ABSENT.

ITEM 11. POSTPONED PRIOR TO HEARING

ITEM 12. HDRC NO. 2024-373
ADDRESS: 319 STIEREN
APPLICANT: jennifer young/wren atelier

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for conceptual approval to:

1. Construct a 330 sq ft addition on the NE corner of existing home.
2. Install a shade covered carport with steel columns at the SE corner of the property over existing concrete driveway.
3. Install a new horizontal wood slat gate in same location as existing picket wooden gate/fence across drive.

RECOMMENDATION:

1. Staff recommends conceptual approval to construct an approximately 330 sq. ft. addition to the side of the primary structure based on findings a through c with the following stipulation;
 - a. That the façade facing the right-of-way (ROW) feature fenestration and the windows proposed for the Eastern façade feature traditional proportions and operations.
2. Staff does not recommend approval to construct a shade structure/carport based on findings a, d, and e.
3. Staff recommends approval to construct a horizontal wood slat gate in same location as existing fence/gate based on findings a and f.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Lisa Lynde on behalf of the King William Association Architectural Advisory Committee, submitted a voicemail recommending approval with staff's stipulations.
- The King William Association Architectural Advisory Committee submitted a letter with the same information outlined in the voicemail.

MOTION: Commissioner Grube moved to approve with staff stipulations.
Commissioner Savino seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Castillo, Savino, Velásquez, Mazuca, Grube, Cervantes, Holland, Fetzer, and Gibbs
NAY: None
ABSENT: Galloway and Guevara

ACTION: MOTION PASSED with 9 AYES. 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT.

ITEM 13. HDRC NO. 2024-417
ADDRESS: 237 W TRAVIS ST
APPLICANT: Jeannine Quesada/Pinnacle Sign Team, Inc

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install signage at 237 W Travis St. Within this request, the applicant has proposed the following:

1. Install one (1), monument sign featuring internal and external illumination sign located within the property's courtyard. The proposed signage will feature an overall width of 2'6" and height of 6' including the existing concrete footer. The total size of the sign will be approximately 10.5 square feet.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff does not recommend approval. The following modifications are necessary to conform with the design guidelines:

- i. That the applicant incorporate durable materials for the requested three acrylic features as noted in finding c.
- ii. That the applicant simplify the finishes and colors used on the sign to no more than three minus the business logo.
- iii. That the applicant simplify the typefaces on the sign as noted in finding e.
- iv. That the applicant use external lighting as noted in finding f.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

MOTION: Vice Chair Fetzer moved to approve with the stipulation that the applicant incorporate a smooth metal panel on the back of the sign facing Camaron St to match the front -facing metal panel in order to hide the T-bar and electrical conduit. Commissioner Savino seconded the motion.

VOTE: AYE: Castillo, Savino, Velásquez, Mazuca, Grube, Cervantes, Holland, Fetzer, and Gibbs
NAY: None
ABSENT: Galloway and Guevara

ACTION: MOTION PASSED with 9 AYES. 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT.

ADJOURNMENT: Chairman Gibbs adjourned the meeting at 4:48 p.m.

APPROVED

J. Maurice Gibbs, Chair
Historic Design Review Commission
City of San Antonio

Date: _____